LABOUR TURNOVER IN THE BANKING SECTOR IN TANZANIA:
A Case Study of NBC Bank and Stanbic Bank in Dar es Salaam City

By
GABRIEL THOBIAS MWITA
(MSC/HRM/DCC/191/11

A Dissertation Submitted to Mzumbe University Dar es Salaam Campus
College in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Award of Master of
Science in Human Resource Management (MSC/HRM) Degree of Mzumbe
University

2013
CERTIFICATION

We, the undersigned, certify that we have read and hereby recommend for acceptance by the Mzumbe University, a dissertation entitled “Labour Turnover in the Banking Industry in Tanzania: A case study of NBC Bank and Stanbic Bank in Dar es Salaam City” in partial fulfillment of the requirements for award of Masters of Science degree in Human Resources Management (MScHRM).

____________________________________
Major Supervisor

____________________________________
Internal Examiner

____________________________________
External Examiner

Accepted for the Board of ……………………………

______________________________________________
PRINCIPAL, COLLEGE BOARD
DECLARATION
AND
COPYRIGHT

I, Gabriel Thobis Mwita, declare that this dissertation is my original work and that; it has not been presented and will not be presented to any other university for a similar or any other degree award.

Signature________________________

Date____________________________

This dissertation is a copyright material protected under the Berne Convention, the Copyright Act 1999 and other international and national enactments in that behalf on intellectual property. It may not be reproduced by any means in full or in part, except for short extracts in fair dealings, for research or private study, critical scholarly review or discourse with an acknowledgement, without the written permission of Mzumbe University on behalf of the author.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

My first and foremost thanks go to the Almighty God for giving me the strength, courage to pursue my studies and conducting this research project. I also extend my thanks to my family for their moral and spiritual support during the whole period of my studies and during the research project. Their encouragement, advice and support enabled me to put in efforts and conclude my studies successfully.

I also feel obliged to thank my supervisor, Dr. Wilhelm Leonard Mafuru for his guidance and support. In a special way thanks are extended to Mr. Paschal Mwikwabe of National Bank of Commerce and Mr. George Shumbusho of Stanbic Bank for their support in distributing questionnaires and collecting responses from their fellow employees. Lastly, but not least, my thanks goes to my fiancée Rahabu Kassimoto, the National Bank of Commerce, Stanbic Bank Management and all respondents for their cooperation and support during the whole duration of my research project.
DEDICATION

I dedicate this dissertation to my son Baraka and my late parents.
ABSTRACT
The overall aim of the research was to analyze labour turnover in the banking sector in Tanzania. For the purpose of understanding the magnitude of the effects of labour turnover in this sector, NBC Bank and Stanbic banks were selected as case studies. Specifically, the study aimed to determine the labour turnover trends in the two selected banks identify and explain the causes of labour turnover in the banks, analyze the impacts or effects of labour turnover in these banks.

The research employed case study design which provided the opportunity to use multiple data collection methods, namely, observations, questionnaires and interviews for primary and for secondary data the study employed documentary reviews.

The study notes that employee turnover has significant effects to the two banks. Such effects include additional costs due to recruitment, hiring and training of new staff. Also labour turnover to the banks leads to the disruption of work flow due to vacant positions which eventually becomes the cause of lower productivity, loss of technical know-how and talent from the experienced employees who decided to leave.

Conclusively the study seems to indicate that turnover is part and parcel of the two banks’ operations and it has seen to have detrimental effects to both the banks and employees, therefore the banks need to come up with proactive measures to retain their employees.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BOT</td>
<td>Bank of Tanzania</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEO</td>
<td>Chief Executive Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HR</td>
<td>Human Resource</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NBC</td>
<td>National Bank of Commerce</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STANBIC</td>
<td>Standard Bank Investment Cooperation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABSA</td>
<td>Amalgamated Bank of South Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HRBP</td>
<td>Human Resource Business Partner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FIBUCA</td>
<td>Financial, Industrial, Banking, Utilities, Commercial, Agricultural and Allied Workers Union&quot; (FIBUCA)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TUICO</td>
<td>Tanzanian Union of Industrial and Commercial Workers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HRBP</td>
<td>Human Resource Business Partner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SMART</td>
<td>Specific, Measurable, Attainable, Realistic and Time Bound</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## TABLE OF CONTENTS

CERTIFICATION .................................................................i
DECLARATION AND COPYRIGHT ...........................................ii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT .........................................................iii
DEDICATION ......................................................................iv
ABSTRACT ......................................................................v
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS ...................................................vi
TABLE OF CONTENTS ........................................................vii

### CHAPTER ONE .................................................................1

**BACKGROUND OF THE PROBLEM** ....................................1

1.1 INTRODUCTION ...........................................................1

1.1 Statement of the problem ..............................................2
1.2 Research Objectives ......................................................2
1.2.1 Specific Objectives ....................................................2
1.3 Research questions .......................................................3
1.4 Significance of the Study ...............................................3
1.5 Definition of Terms ......................................................4
1.5.1 Employees: ..............................................................4
1.5.2 Turnover: ...............................................................4
1.5.3 Remuneration: this term mean a monthly payable salary and benefits ....4
1.5.4 Rewards: mean all performance based payment paid to employees ....4
1.6 Delimitations and Limitations ........................................4
1.6.1 Delimitations ..........................................................4
1.6.2 Limitations ............................................................4

### CHAPTER TWO .................................................................6

**LITERATURE REVIEW** .....................................................6

2.1 Introduction ..................................................................6
2.2 Staff Turnover Overview ..............................................6
2.3 Reasons for staff turnover .............................................8
2.3.1 Outside Factors ........................................................9
2.3.2 Functional Factors ........................................................................................................ 9
2.3.3 Push Factors .................................................................................................................. 9
2.3.4 Pull Factors ................................................................................................................... 9
2.4 Impacts of staff turnover .................................................................................................. 11
2.4.1 Effects on productivity ................................................................................................. 11
2.4.2 Effects on financial returns .......................................................................................... 12
2.4.3 Decline of service quality ............................................................................................ 12
2.4.4 Lost business opportunities ......................................................................................... 13
2.5 Conceptual Framework .................................................................................................... 14

CHAPTER THREE .................................................................................................................. 16
RESEARCH METHODOLOGY ................................................................................................. 16
3.1 Introduction ....................................................................................................................... 16
3.2 Research Approach / Research Paradigm ......................................................................... 16
3.2.1 Mixed Approach ........................................................................................................... 16
3.3 Research Design ............................................................................................................... 18
3.4 Area of Study .................................................................................................................... 19
3.5 Population ......................................................................................................................... 19
3.6 Sample and Sampling Procedures ..................................................................................... 20
3.7 Sources of Research Data ................................................................................................. 21
3.7.1 The Primary data .......................................................................................................... 21
3.7.2 The Secondary data ..................................................................................................... 21
3.8 Data Collection Method ................................................................................................... 22
3.8.1 Structured Interviews ................................................................................................. 22
3.8.2 Self-administered questionnaires ................................................................................ 22
3.8.3 Documentary review .................................................................................................... 22
3.9 Reliability .......................................................................................................................... 23
3.10 Data Analysis .................................................................................................................... 23
CHAPTER FOUR

DATA PRESENTATION AND DISCUSSIONS

4.1 Introduction

4.2 State of Labour Turnover at NBC Bank

4.2.1 History of NBC Bank

4.2.2 NBC Vision and Mission Statements

4.2.3 The Role of Human Resource Department at NBC Bank

4.2.4 Age profile of respondents

4.2.5 Gender profile of respondents

4.2.6 Labour turnover at NBC

4.2.6.1 Understanding Labour Turnover at NBC

4.2.6.2 Factors for labour turnover at NBC

4.2.7 Trend of Labour Turnover

4.2.7.1 Turnover Trend: 2007-2012

4.2.7.3 Age profile of exit employees

4.2.7.4 Level of education of exit employees

4.2.7.5 Gender profile of exit employees

4.2.7.6 Level of work experience of exit employees

4.2.7.7 Position held by exit employees at the time of exit

4.2.8.1 Senior staff enjoys more recognition than junior staff

4.2.8.2 Opinions of employees are undervalued

4.2.8.3 Additional qualifications of employees are not recognized

4.2.8.4 Qualifications are considered for promotion

4.2.8.5 Work experience is considered for promotion

4.2.8.6 Dissatisfaction with job characteristics / content

4.2.8.7 Dissatisfaction with relationship with supervisors

4.2.9 Coping with Labour Turnover at the Bank

4.2.10 Concluding Remarks

4.3 State of Labour Turnover at Stanbic Bank

4.3.1 History of Stanbic Bank

4.3.2 Stanbic Vision and Mission Statements

4.3.3 The Role of Human Resource Department at Stanbic Bank
4.3.4 Age profile of respondents ................................................................. 45
4.3.5 Gender profile of respondents .......................................................... 45
4.3.6 Labour Turnover at Stanbic Bank ....................................................... 46

4.3.6.1 Understanding the Factors for Labour Turnover ................................. 46
4.3.7 Trend of Labour Turnover ................................................................. 47

4.3.7.1 Turnover Trend at Stanbic Bank: 2007-2012 ........................................ 47
4.3.7.2 Employee Turnover Rates ............................................................... 49
4.3.7.3 Age profile of exit employees ......................................................... 49
4.3.7.4 Level of education of exit employees ............................................... 50
4.3.7.5 Gender profile of exit employees ..................................................... 51
4.3.7.6 Level of work experience of exit employees ....................................... 51
4.3.7.7 Position held by exit employees at the time of exit ............................... 52
4.3.8 Reasons or causes of labour turnover ................................................. 53

4.3.8.1 Senior staff enjoys more recognition than junior staff ......................... 53
4.3.8.2 Opinions of employees are undervalued .......................................... 54
4.3.8.3 Additional qualifications of employees are not recognized .................... 55
4.3.8.4 Qualifications are considered for promotion ...................................... 56
4.3.8.5 Work experience is considered for promotion .................................... 57
4.3.8.6 Dissatisfaction with job characteristics / content ................................ 57
4.3.8.7 Dissatisfaction with relationship with supervisors ............................... 58
4.3.9 Coping with Labour Turnover at Stanbic Bank .................................... 59
4.3.10 Concluding Remarks ....................................................................... 60
4.4 Cross Case Comparison ....................................................................... 61

4.4.1 Reasons for Labour Turnover in the selected banks .............................. 61
4.4.2 Willingness to stay on the job or readiness to leave ............................... 63
4.4.3 Employee Turnover Costs .................................................................. 66

4.5 Discussion of the findings .................................................................... 67

4.5.1 Intrinsic characteristics ...................................................................... 67
4.5.2 Extrinsic characteristics ...................................................................... 67
4.5.3 Individual Characteristics .................................................................... 68
CHAPTER FIVE ................................................................................................................................. 70
SUMMARY OF FINDINGS, CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS. 70
REFERENCES ........................................................................................................................................ 75
APPENDIX I: LABOUR TURNOVER IN THE BANKING SECTOR IN TANZANIA ............................................ 78
APPENDIX II: LABOUR TURNOVER IN THE BANKING SECTOR IN TANZANIA ............................................ 83
APPENDIX III: INTERVIEW GUIDE ........................................................................................................ 92
CHAPTER ONE
BACKGROUND OF THE PROBLEM

1.1 INTRODUCTION
Being a pervasive feature of the labour market, labour turnover has drawn considerable attention to senior management, human resource professionals, industrial psychologists and researchers in the field of human resource management. The impact of labour turnover has been felt on the side of the organizations as well as to the concerned employees.

Despite the fact that modern organizations strive hard to remain competitive and achieve their goals through meeting customers’ expectations, however, staff turnover seems to be a challenge that jeopardize such organizations from achieving their goals. For example, as cited by CIPD (2009), the estimated average cost per employee who left the organization was considered to be too high.

Turnover occurs when an employee leaves a specific job or organization permanently. Employee turnover is the rotation of workers around the labour market, between firms, jobs and occupation and between the states of employment and unemployment (Abassi et al., 2000). High turnover rates create particular pressures for Human Resources department (Huselid, 1995).

Ideally it could be thought that such sectors with poor remuneration schemes could be the ones mostly affected by the challenges of labour turnover, but the reality shows the contrary. Such sectors with attractive packages have equally been affected by the problems of labour turnover. For Tanzanian situation, the banking sector is among of the leading sectors in rewarding of its employees.
Certain banks have in place employees’ recognition programs, pay annual bonuses based on employee’s performance and good retirement plans yet the sector experiences staff turnover. Cited from NBC Bank, Stanbic Bank and Bank of Tanzania (BOT) in average the staff turnover for the past three years has been 16%, 12.1% and 4% respectively.

Given such a background in the banking sector with good remuneration schemes and having what seems to be good care to its employees, but the banks are still caught at the cross road and are challenged by the problem of having unstable workforce as a result of labour turnover. Dwelling on this reality, therefore, it has come to the attention of this research to and investigated on the issue of labour turnover in the banking sector.

1.1 Statement of the problem

Although employee turnover has been interpreted as voluntary quits or dismissal as a result of underperformance, there was a need to have a clear understanding and interpretation of the causes of labour turnover for each sector documented separately. The purpose for this move was to have the causes of labour turnover which are context-specific and their impacts thereof.

For that matter any organization which needs to remain competitive as well as achieving its objectives, it is required to have a clear understanding of the challenges of the labour turnover from the perspective of the context-specific within its sector. It is within this notion; therefore, this research conducted an analysis of the labour turnover in the Tanzanian banking sector.

1.2 Research Objectives

The overall aim of the research was to analyze labour turnover in the banking sector in Tanzania by focusing on the NBC Bank and Stanbic banks as case studies.

1.2.1 Specific Objectives

i. To determine the labour turnover trends in the selected banks

ii. To identify and explain the causes of labour turnover in the selected banks
iii. To analyze the impacts or effects of labour turnover in the selected banks
iv. To identify measures taken by banks to deal with labour turnover.

1.3 Research questions
i. What is the trend of labour turnover rate for the past six years?
ii. Why do employees leave employment from the selected banks?
iii. What is the cost of labour turnover to the selected banks?
iv. What are measures taken by banks to deal with employee turnover?

1.4 Significance of the Study
The phenomenon of turnover is of interest to organizations and theorists because it is significant potentially costly and relatively clear. It also describes the end result of a decision process. The goal of ‘effective management of turnover’ dictates that a high level of Human Resource Management practices needs to be achieved by organizations in order to positively influence the turnover process.

The findings of this study on the causes and impact of Labour Turnover provides some insights on how the turnover issues can be managed to Human Resources practitioners and Chief Executive Officers (CEO) of the selected banks and the banking industry as a whole, specifically as well as enhancing general knowledge on the issue to other banks in Tanzania.

Furthermore the finding of this research provides young researchers and students of human resource management with the knowledge and understanding of labour turnover in the banking industry as a concept and practice in the labour market. Also the study offers some suggestions on the measures or coping strategies for dealing with staff turnover as a way of improving the retention of staff in the Tanzanian banking sector.
1.5 Definition of Terms
The following are definitions of selected key terms as used in this study:

1.5.1 Employees: These are all people employed by an organization for a specified period of time or unspecific period of time, this terms excludes those employed and working as casuals. The term employee shall be used interchangeably with Staff and Labour.

1.5.2 Turnover: the term is referred to those employees who have left organizations voluntarily; it shall exclude employees who left employment through termination, retirement, retrenchment or death.

1.5.3 Remuneration: this term mean a monthly payable salary and benefits

1.5.4 Rewards: mean all performance based payment paid to employees.

1.6 Delimitations and Limitations

1.6.1 Delimitations
This study is delimited to the causes and effects of staff turnover in the banking sector, specifically to NBC and Stanbic bank and has focused to all job levels namely management, supervisors, officers and clerks.

1.6.2 Limitations
In doing this study, the researcher has encountered a number of constrains/ limitations as highlighted below:

Time Limitations
This study has been carried out for a short period of time because the requirement was to do so as to follow the deadline of the academic calendar of Mzumbe University while at the same time accomplishing his duties as an employee. Due to time constraint, the researcher has used only few respondents which might have affected the quality of the research.
**Constraints relating to Respondents**

During this study, it has been difficulty for respondents to respond as it was expected due to the fact that not all expected respondents responded as it was expected (some expected respondents didn’t respond at all), some didn’t appear to the schedule interview at the planned time and even those who appeared in the planned time some were interrupted by calls to attend their work. Furthermore it was observed that some employees even if they were allowed to come for the interview they were not confident enough to share company issues, this made the researcher either to postponed the interviews and sometimes to use a lot of probing questions for employees to open up with more information.

**Lack of local empirical literature**

There have been difficulties in accessing of empirical literature on labour turnover in the banking sector in the Tanzanian context.
CHAPTER TWO
LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 Introduction
The basis of this chapter was to evaluate different issues relating to staff turnover in organizations. The chapter therefore addresses the overview of theories and principles guiding the idea of labour turnover and finally developed the conceptual framework that guided the study.

2.2 Staff Turnover Overview
In recent decades turnover issues have been increasing which has brought organization to become unstable and harden the work of HR department. These unstable situations have call upon the attention of many authors and researchers to investigate about this phenomenon. The rate of turnover varies from company to company. The highest level of turnover normally found in private sectors than public sectors.

The levels of turnover also vary from region to region. The highest rates are found where unemployment rate is lower and where it is easy for people to get alternative employment (Rankin, 2006). Sometimes employee turnover benefits organizations positively. This might happen when a poor performer is replaced by a more skilled employee and when a retired employee replaced by a younger one.

Employee turnover may be also costly as it requires different cost to take account such as administrative costs of recruitment, cost of covering during the period in which there is a vacancy, training cost for the new employee etc (Philips, 1990). Turnover occurs for many different reasons. Sometimes new job attracts employees and pull them to leave the old one.
In contrary employee also pushed to leave job due to the dissatisfaction in their present workplace or by domestic circumstances when someone reallocates with their spouse or partner. A poor relationship with the management can be an important reason for the employees to leave their jobs. It is relatively rare for people to leave jobs in which they are happy even offered by higher salary elsewhere (Campion, 1991).

Turnover could be minimized through considering different preventive measures by the management. These may include providing training to the line managers for an effective supervision before appointing or upgrading them, providing security of jobs with good working environment etc. There may be an offer for re-training the existing managers who have a poor record at keeping their staff happily.

Supervising managers could be accountable for employee turnover in their teams. Maximization of opportunities for individual employees such as accommodate individual preferences on working hours, regular appraisals, providing as much job security as possible can help to reduce turnover, Hutchinson (2003). Employee turnover can be extremely devastating for any company.

It makes the employers difficult to maintain a steady and successful operation. Management should have its own ratings on employee turnover and measurement on how this affects organizations performance. Losing a single key worker can decrease the likelihood of a project’s success and can reduce investors’ confidence in the firm, Lee and Mitchell (2000).

Many academic scholars pointed out turnover as the correlation between job dissatisfaction and decreased organizational commitment. The stronger the feeling of discontent in one’s job, the more likely one is to begin a search for an alternative job. This perspective on turnover highlights the role of emotions and attitudes as antecedents of behavior.
When an employee leaves an organization, it can have a variety of effects that not only impact on the organization, but also the individual employee and the society, Mobley (1982).

The problem of employee turnover has been a mystery harassing organizations and particularly banks for decades. Almost universally organizations’ executives have been allegedly unworried regarding the issue of employee turnover. Few organizations have attempted to investigate what drives employees out of their organizations, and far fewer have invested concerted efforts into preventing it. The fact is the problem of employee turnover is not a paradox. Its causes can, and have, been determined, and appropriate ways for plummeting turnover have been executed, (Kevin et al. 2004).

While, there is no common agreed structure for understanding the employees’ turnover process as a whole, there is a wide variety of causes that have been established useful in understanding employee turnover (Kevin et al. 2004). Therefore, there is a need to develop a fuller understanding of the employee turnover, more especially, the sources-what determines employee turnover, measurements, effects and strategies that managers can put in place to minimize turnover.

2.3 Reasons for staff turnover

People leave jobs for variety of reasons, many of which are wholly outside the power of the organisation to influence. These mixtures of reasons have been categorized by Torrington et al (2008) and Taylor (2008) as voluntary and involuntary reasons. To begin with, we need to introduce and define the concepts of turnover. Maertz and Campion (2001) define voluntary turnover as 'instances wherein management agrees that the employee had the physical opportunity to continue employment with the company, at the time of termination'. This is similar to the definition by Morrell et al. (2001) '[voluntary turnover] is voluntary cessation of membership of an organization by an employee of that organization'. There are four generic categories of reasons for voluntary turnover (Jenner and Taylor, 2000) as discussed below:
2.3.1 Outside Factors
This occurs when someone leaves for reasons that are largely unrelated to their work, such as moving away, illness and other ambitions such turnover is unavoidable. However, factors which are impediments to continued employment and are within the control of management and should be addressed. These exits which are within employers control such as resignation can be caused by outside factors like spouse or partner relocation or maternity leave, Hendrie (2004).

2.3.2 Functional Factors
This category includes all resignations that are welcomed by both employer and employee. The major examples are those that stem from an individual's poor work performance or failure to fit in comfortably with an organizational or developmental culture just as dismissal can be due to redundancy or misconduct. However, the main solution lies in improving recruitment and selection procedures so that fewer people in the category are appointed in the first place, CIPD (2009).

2.3.3 Push Factors
Here the problem is dissatisfaction with work or the organization leading to unwanted turnover. This is where there are significant opportunities for employer action to address the problem. Through the internal factors, CIPD (2009) identified inadequate management techniques, inability to address issues, and failure to follow through with responsibilities, favoritism, short-staffed, and hence put on mandatory overtime. In addition to that, CIPD (2009) found poor relationship with a line manager can result to a push factor that forces employees to quit their job and leave the organization.

2.3.4 Pull Factors
The opposite side of the coin is the attraction of rival employers. Lee and Mitchell (1994) argued that voluntary turnover cannot occur without the presence of attractive alternatives and these include better reward packages, career advancement opportunities.
Staff quitting the Banking industry may be leaving to go to other commercial banks or they may be quitting financial sectors entirely.

The following chart adapted from Loquercio et al. (2006) gives a clear picture of staff turnover ladder.

**Figure 1: Types of Staff Turnover –**

![Turnover Diagram](chart.png)

Source: Loquercio et al. (2006)

While Loquercio et al. (2006) traces the causes of staff turnover as indicated above, Branham (2005) and Torrington et al, (2008) highlights a number of factors that contribute to employee turnover as explored below.Branham (2005) came to find out seven hidden reasons of why employees leave and these are a mismatch between the person and the job, too little coaching and feedback, feeling devalued and unrecognized, stress from overwork and work life balance and lastly loss of trust and confidence in senior leaders.
2.4 Impacts of staff turnover

Turnover occurs in different aspect and can cause serious obstacle to productivity, quality, Cost of production, Customer satisfaction level and profitability at firms of all sizes. However CIPD 2009 suggest turnover becomes problematic depending on the labour market of the organisation. Where skills are relative easy to find and training of the new employees quickly it is possible to retain quality of service unlike where the labour market is tight and recruitment cost are high causes problems to the organisation. Staff turnover affects the organisation practice in four main areas: Productivity, Financial Returns, Service quality and Business opportunities. Such costs are very difficult to calculate, ACAS (1994):

2.4.1 Effects on productivity

Labour turnover results to Increasing workload for the remaining staff. This is rather an obvious, but thinks about the work that's left undone which forces other staff to get involved to finish other person’s work. However this may affect the individual performance as result of work overload which in the long run affects the organisation performance as customer expectations are not met. Inexperienced employees may provide less personalized services because they don’t know the clients and this may force customers to switch firms.

Furthermore, lower morale for 'good' staff. Staff who work hard - those with a sense of duty and organizational commitment, tend to be much more negatively affected by the increased work generated by high staff turnover. Most of the time they like to get things done completely and done well, which is almost impossible when a vacant position's work is being covered. Consequently, and this is a killer, it's the best staff who tend to be most depressed or angry about vacancies, and are more likely to walk if the situation remains unresolved.
2.4.2 Effects on financial returns
Labour turnover lead to decreased income due to reduced productivity. Whether it is because either employee are physically missing or they cannot do as much when they are filling in for others. With vacancies in organisation means slowing production in every unit which result of losing more money out of the organisation. Hom and Griffeth (1995) discover financial cost affects three main components of the financial system in an organisation and these are; Separation cost that consists of administrative costs (Recruitment cost, Selection cost, Induction training for new people), Lost of client revenues and exit interviews. Replacement costs include expenses incurred to replace leavers such as expenses for advertising job vacancies. Training cost which consist of the company’s expenditures to orient and train replacements and opportunity costs caused by inefficient production.

2.4.3 Decline of service quality
The continue process of turnover in an organisation may lower the standards of services provided to customers. This is likely to be experienced by customers who interact with the front line employees like the customer service or the receptionist that display the image of the organisation. The frustration derived from understaffed and work load ahead of them, Griffeth and Hom (2001) discover clients encounter delayed and interrupted services from less competent or inexperienced employees.

The departure of experienced service workers disrupts the transmission of service values and norms that are essential for quality service to new generation of workers. Moreover, the decline of quality services tend to aggravate both the customers and the employees, as customers become unsatisfied with the service offered and hence may force them to shift firms, whereas employees energy wears out for them to maintain the level of service throughout as they are working under pressure.
2.4.4 Lost business opportunities

This is another effect of high turnover identified by ACAS (2010) that threaten company’s market. However, the extent to which organisation loses its business is much influenced by productivity decline as there is inadequate labour power to produce and compete the current market. Turnover may hamper the future survival of the organisation this is because employees leave with their skills, knowledge and talents that is useful for researching and discovering new products to make firms stay ahead of the market.

Furthermore, demoralization among the employees caused by the work load which may lead or increase on one of HR burning issues of absenteeism in the organisation. Anantharaja (2009) realizes corporate depends upon their human assets to survive and thrive which imply further increase level of absenteeism and turnover jeopardizes organization performance. In addition to that Lopez (1993) found out former employees tend to take customers away especially when joining new competitor company as result company loses most of its capital and profit due to customers feel uncomfortable remaining in an organization that has unfamiliar faces to serve them hence affecting the income of the firm.

However, it should be noted the impacts of turnover does not only affect the organization but also employees who have left as Mohammad and Nathan (2008) found out the cost of turnover for employees includes loss of prestige especially if an employee is working in a reputable organization and is forced to resign due to poor performance. Employees feel proud working on big and most recognized companies and when it is taken away it makes them losing one of their statuses. Moreover, the cost of job search which consumes time and money mostly without forgetting its disappointed because of rejections or even ignoring your applications. Lastly, the cost of adjusting to the new employer which can very frustrating and challenging too and this is where the induction crisis theory comes, as employees find it hard to cope with new environment, management and organization.
Just as it has been noted above, turnover can have the opposite ramifications for certain firms and employees. Hom and Griffeth, 1995 assert that turnover can increase organizational effectiveness and performance. The transfusion of fresh employees who do not have the experience may be motivated to work hard and outperform the seasoned employees. The new entrants have more current skills, knowledge which are useful to promote innovative ideas and methods thus renew a stagnation organization. Furthermore, poor performance is widely expressed by the long lived employees who becomes ineffective because they rely on the routine work pattern and difficult to adapt new changes.

Moreover, Turnover is believed to reduce unnecessary labour cost in the organisation (Hom and Griffeth, 1995). Voluntary turnover especially to poor performers may help corporations to lower the labour cost through cut of payrolls which act as a less costly way of downsizing. In addition to that, exit employees may provide more promotion opportunities for the remaining employees (Hom and Griffeth, 1995). The more turnover occurs in the organisation, the more promotions are available and less competitive it becomes for the remaining employees.

This is what Krausz et al (1999) explains the more attrition it gets on one end the better it gets on other employees. Turnover is an index of organizational effectiveness and as such it authorizes attention and some understanding of itself. Despite an enormous literature on turnover in organizations, there is as yet no universally accepted account or framework for why people choose to leave (Abelson 1987).

2.5 Conceptual Framework

Based on the literature review, a conceptual framework to analyze the factors for staff turnover has been constructed in Figure 2.2. This framework helps to understand how the identified variables lead to staff turnover in the Banks. The variables have been grouped into three categories namely intrinsic, extrinsic and demographic of personal variables.
Figure 2.2 Staff Turnover Framework  
Source Lee and Mitchell (2000)

- **Intrinsic characteristic**
  - Achievements
  - Recognition
  - Responsibility
  - Work itself
  - Advancement

- **Extrinsic characteristic**
  - Working conditions
    - Salary
    - Policies
    - Supervision
    - Relationships
  - Age
  - Tenure
  - Gender
  - Marital Status
  - Education

- **Individual Characteristic**
  - Intention to leave
  - Stay
  - Turnover
  - Or
  - Dependent Variable

- **Independent Variables**
CHAPTER THREE

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

3.1 Introduction
This chapter concentrates with the conceptual arrangement within which the research has been conducted. It covers the research approach, design, area of the study, study population, data collection methods and procedures, sampling method, selection of respondents, and data analysis techniques. The chapter provides systematic ways which that were applied to solve the research problem presented in chapter one.

3.2 Research Approach / Research Paradigm
According to Creswell (2003), “A paradigm is a perspective based on a set of assumptions, concepts and values that are held by a community or researchers.” There exist three main paradigms of research namely qualitative, quantitative and mixed which are discussed below:

3.2.1 Mixed Approach
This study has used a mixed research approach. Anderson (2009) defines a mixed research approach as “the class of research where the researcher mixes or combines quantitative and qualitative research techniques, methods, approaches, concepts or language into a single study”. A mixed method approach, therefore, presents a logical and intuitive appeal hence provides a platform for bridging the divide between qualitative and quantitative paradigms. This attribute, consequently, makes an increasing number of researchers to utilize mixed method designs in undertaking their studies (Onwuegbuzie & Leech, 2005)

On their own though, quantitative and qualitative methods have some strengths, but more benefits are realized when they are brought together. This point is further highlighted by Connelly (2009, pp.31) who wrote that “the goal of mixed methods research is to draw on the strengths and minimize the weaknesses of both types of research”.

16
Fundamentally, it has been seen important that the researcher be able to choose a research design that better addresses the research questions posed. And, the realization from this perspective was that mixed method is the right choice, is the research instrument, which drawn on the desirable attributes of different research designs. Connelly (2009) also asserts that: a mixed method design is good since it is based on a pragmatic philosophy that states that a researcher ought to use an approach or combination of approaches, which would appropriately address research questions.

Yin (2006) argues that mixed method research does not, necessarily, have to combine quantitative and qualitative approaches all the time. That is, there is a possibility of having a mixed method approach even in a case where two quantitative approaches have been exclusively used. The author goes on to give an example of a study combining experimentation and surveys, which are both quantitative in design. He indicates that mixing them helps in enhancing internal and external validity, than either method used on its own. Equally, it is possible to mix a qualitative approach with another qualitative approach. Yin (2006) also indicates that depending on the objective, many distinct designs are a reality under a mixed method study. The author also posits that various types of mixed methods designs are possible, depending on the importance accorded the qualitative and quantitative portions.

Mixed methods also enable researchers to address a wide and a more defined range of research questions since they are not confined to one approach. And, as already pointed earlier, a researcher can use one method to overcome weaknesses in another method and hence have stronger evidence for a conclusion (Yin, 2006). Based on the above mentioned strength of the mixed research approach, This study adopted the same approach (mixed approach) with the aim of responding to the research questions of this study which requires both narratives(qualitative) and numbers (Quantitative) to be use in producing a more comprehensive understanding of labour turnover required to inform decision making, enabled the researcher to have ability to collect both qualitative and
quantitative data at the same time and thus the data collection process was not necessarily been sequential, but also enabled the researcher to use narration to add meaning to numbers and also applying numbers to bring precision to narrative data. Furthermore a mixed method approach has enriched this study in the sense that it has promoted clarity, accuracy and nuance.

3.3 Research Design

This investigation has adopted a case study design as an approach in researching the subject matter. Case study method enables a researcher to closely examine the data within a specific context. In most cases, a case study method selects a small geographical area or a very limited number of individuals as the subjects of study. Case studies, in their true essence, explore and case study as a research method investigate contemporary real-life phenomenon through detailed contextual analysis of a limited number of events, conditions, and their inter-relationships (Yin, 1984).

Yin (1984) defines the case study research method as an empirical inquiry that investigates a contemporary phenomenon within its real-life context; when the boundaries between phenomenon and context are not clearly evident; and in which multiple sources of evidence are used. Yin (1984) further argued that, there are a number of advantages in using case studies such as, the examination of the data are often conducted within the context of its use that is within the situation in which the activity takes place.

On employment and working relationship, it is assumed that individuals (Employees) and organizations (Employer) are in a state of equilibrium, where the employees perform their duties to contribute to the organization while the employer provides to employees with compensation and benefits in return. However, despite of these employees being compensated in return to the services they provide, in real life Employees have much more expectations both intrinsic and extrinsic returns from their employers.
Some of these expectations are well said by employees in their various forums while other expectations are not said at all. The mismatch between employee’s expectations and their rewards is what calls for labour turnover in most of the organizations.

The study has focused on labour turnover in the banking sector which is a real life and currently an alarming phenomenon in most of the organizations. It must further be noted that the reasons and the extent organizations are impacted as a result of staff turnover varies from one organization to another based on the size of the organization, working environment, leadership style, organizational policies and procedures, nature of the business, ownership and pay structures. Despites of all these, the paradox still remains as to why employee leaves banks despite of being paid good salaries and fringe benefits? The reasons here were not clearly known and thus called for a case study to investigate this real life phenomenon.

3.4 Area of Study
This study has been conducted at the Head Offices of National Bank of Commerce (NBC) and Stanbic Bank Tanzania in the City of Dar Es Salaam. The selected banks are both Public- private owned bank (National Bank of Commerce) and the private bank (Stanbic bank). The selection of the above mentioned banks have considered for a right mix and representation of the Banking sector in the country, the kind of salaries and fringe benefits paid by these banks to their employees as well as the turnover rate in these banks. The researcher decided to use the Head Offices of these banks in Dar Es Salaam because of the percentage of employees at head office is high as compared to branch offices and again it is easy to access most of the required documents at head office as compared to branch offices.

3.5 Population
The targeted population was the entire group a researcher is interested in; the group about which the researcher wishes to draw conclusions Neuman (2000) defines a research population as the specific pool of cases, individuals or group(s) of individuals
which the researcher wishes to investigates. Since the major objective of the study was to explore staff turnover causes and impact in the banking sector in Tanzania with central reference to NBC and Stanbic bank, the population of the study has comprised all NBC and Stanbic bank current employees and management staff.

3.6 Sample and Sampling Procedures
A sample is defined as “A subset of the population. It comprises some members selected from the population” (Sekaran, 2000). Somekh and Lewin (2005) refer to a sample as a selection of individuals from the entire population, who would be included in the data collection. The sample size of this study has been categorized into three facets that is; Management, Supervisors and Officers.

The sampling approach adopted in this investigation is convenience or accidental method. Convenience sampling is a non-probability sampling technique where subjects are selected because of their convenient accessibility and proximity to the researcher. The subjects have been selected just because they are easiest to recruit for the study and the researcher has considered selecting subjects that are representative of the entire population.

In all forms of research, it would be ideal to test the entire population, but in most cases, the population is just too large that it is impossible to include every individual. This is the reason why most researchers rely on sampling techniques like convenience sampling, the most common of all sampling techniques. Many researchers prefer this sampling technique because it is fast, inexpensive, easy and the subjects are readily available (Neuman, 2000)
Table 3.1: Sample Size of the Study: National Bank of Commerce

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S/N</th>
<th>Employee Category</th>
<th>Population</th>
<th>Sample</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Management</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>supervisors</td>
<td>273</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Other Officers</td>
<td>857</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>1200</strong></td>
<td><strong>40</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source, Field data 2013

Table 3.2: Sample Size of the Study: Stanbic Bank

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S/N</th>
<th>Employee Category</th>
<th>Population</th>
<th>Sample</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Management</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>supervisors</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Other Officers</td>
<td>197</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>310</strong></td>
<td><strong>20</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source, Field data 2013

3.7 Sources of Research Data

3.7.1 The Primary data

Primary data are those data which are collected for the first time, taking a sample, representing a population. It is not a published data, it is problem specific data collected by the researcher, first time. When primary data is published by researcher, it becomes the secondary data for everybody, other than the researcher (Ivy (2002)).

3.7.2 The Secondary data

Secondary data are data already published and collected for other reasons other than the specific research question at hand (Ivy, 2002). The secondary sources of data used included the following: Publications, articles and other written documents available in libraries, Research reports from distinguished academicians, Media i.e. News papers and Internet.
3.8 Data Collection Method

For the purpose of this research, self-administered questionnaires have been used as the major data collection instrument; for this kind of data, questions were presented in the same order to all respondents. Other methods used for data collection includes interviews, document review and discussion.

3.8.1 Structured Interviews

The researcher used the structured interview to collect data from the respondents. This method has been applicable to management staff and Human Resource Officers who were expected to give much information on how organizations are being impacted by staff turnover and provides information relating to strategic measures in place for dealing with the turnover. The choice of this method to the selected above mentioned respondents aimed at treating the said respondents the same and thus eased the comparison between the two banks since the same questions and response evaluation options were used, also it ensured that answers be reliably aggregated and that comparisons be made with confidence between sample subgroups.

3.8.2 Self-administered questionnaires

The researcher also used self-administered questionnaire in the data collection process. This method of self-administered questionnaire has been used to cover the majority of respondents who are the Supervisors, Officers of the selected banks. Despite of its coverage it has been the more cost effective method to administer than personal (face-to-face) interviews and they have been relatively easy to analyze. They also reduced the possibility of these lower cadre staff to fear in their participation to the survey. Further the self-administered questionnaires have convenient since respondents completed them at a time and place that is convenient for them.

3.8.3 Documentary review

The researcher also reviewed various Human resource related documents specifically those concern with Human Resource Planning, remuneration and rewards policies,
Grading Structures, Salary structures, Career progressing policy, Talent management programs and policy, Training programs, Organization structures (Reporting relationships) as well as Exit interview records. Review of the above mentioned documents in the selected banks enabled the researcher to make triangulation of data drawn from interviews and questionnaires.

3.9 Reliability
Reliability is the consistency of measurement, or the degree to which an instrument measures the same way each time it is used under the same condition with the same subjects. In short, it is the repeatability of researcher’s measurement (Ivy, 2002). A measure is considered reliable if a person's score on the same test given twice is similar. It is important to remember that reliability is not measured, it is estimated.

In order to increase the internal reliability of the data collection, field-note taking has been used while conducting the interview. The use of words and sentence structures in the scripts has been discussed between the researcher and the respondents to minimize misunderstanding, misleading and misinterpretation of the findings. As for questionnaire, a pilot study has been conducted before distributing the questionnaire to respondents. This helped the researcher to measure how well the instrument is understood by respondents and where the difficulties in completing the questionnaire were noted, the researcher rectified and uses words which were well understood by respondents.

3.10 Data Analysis
After data collection, analysis of data started immediately. CIPD (2009) emphasizes on the fact that it is best to begin analyzing the data as soon as the initial data has been collected, this will act as a guide to any further data collection. Data analysis means to organize, provide structure and elicits meaning. Any significant statement will be collected to produce full descriptive experience.
Data analysis will be the most time consuming process but the researcher needs to consider the validity and credibility of data (CIPD, 2009).

The processing of quantitative data collected from the selected sample has been analyzed with the Scientific Package for Social Sciences software. Qualitative data from the in-depth analysis of the interview has been analyzed using content analysis approach. The researcher focused at the themes emerging from the data, coded them and then put them into conceptual categories in a way that described what was happening. Data obtained through questionnaire have been quantified, tabulated and summarized in tables and then analyzed by means of simple statistical techniques in order to investigate variables and their effects.
CHAPTER FOUR
DATA PRESENTATION AND DISCUSSIONS

4.1 Introduction
This chapter presents the research data which are then followed by their discussions. The research findings are in relation to the research objectives aimed at in this research. The chapter narrates the findings from each case thereafter there is a cross case comparison to reveal the extent to which of there are similarities or differences in the state of labour turnover between the two selected banks.

4.2 State of Labour Turnover at NBC Bank
4.2.1 History of NBC Bank
NBC Ltd. was formed on 1st April 2000 when NBC (1997) Ltd. was privatized and sold to ABSA Group Ltd. of South Africa. NBC (1997) Ltd. was itself born out of the nationalization of banks and financial institutions in Tanzania in 1967. Tanzania later deregulated banking in 1991. In 1997, a decision was taken to split NBC into three entities, namely NBC Holding Corporation, National Micro-finance Bank (NMB) and NBC (1997) Limited. This was the first step towards the privatization of NBC. The privatization of NBC resulted to a number of shareholders and thus the shareholding structure is: ABSA Group Ltd. 55%, Government of the Republic of Tanzania 30% and International Finance Corporation 15%.

4.2.2 NBC Vision and Mission Statements
NBC Vision statement is to be the 'Go-To' bank and its Mission statement is

We are a caring financial services provider, partnering with all our stakeholders to create prosperity through a customer centric, innovative and diverse product offering.
4.2.3 The Role of Human Resource Department at NBC Bank

The human resource department at NBC plays a major role on supporting the management of human resources at the bank. The Bank has adopted the Human Resource Business (HRBP) Partner model in which the HR department is considered as partners to the Business. To make this partnership effective, most of HR related functions like Recruitment, Performance Management, Training and development are being performed in partnership with respective line managers.

The human resource department is the custodian of all HR policies in which they are the one who develops and monitors their implementations. Among of the HR policies in place includes Recruitment and selection, Performance Management, Rewards Management, Training and Development, Staff Movement, Talent Management and Succession planning policies.

4.2.4 Age profile of respondents

The researcher analysed the age profile of respondents and feedback was documented as shown in the table below;

Table 4.1: Age profile of respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age Group</th>
<th>No. of respondents</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>25-30 years</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31-35 years</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>44%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36-40 years</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>41%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41-50 years</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Field data (2013)

Findings of the study show that 44% of respondents were aged 31-45 years, 41% of respondents were aged 36-40 years, 13% of respondents are aged 41-50 years and 3% of respondents were aged 25-30 years.

4.2.5 Gender profile of respondents

The researcher analysed gender of respondents and feedback was documented as shown in the table below;
Table 4.2: Gender profile of respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Males</th>
<th>Females</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No. of respondents</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td>41%</td>
<td>59%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Field data (2013)

Findings above show that 59% of respondents were females and 41% of respondents were males. These findings show that there are more female respondents than male respondents.

4.2.6 Labour turnover at NBC

4.2.6.1 Understanding Labour Turnover at NBC

Through the interviews with 13 respondent’s it was revealed that employees especially those who perceived themselves to be talented felt that there was a need for them to be treated in the same way as their counterparts from other companies since they were in the similar works in the same industry. This feeling went hand in hand with being treated fairly and equitably like others in the similar positions. They further clarified that keeping good employees had more to do with how the organization managed than payment. During the same interviews, most of the respondents had the views that in most cases employees at the bank decided to stay or leave because of their relationship with their line managers as well as the absence of the opportunities for them to contribute for the development of the bank or advance in their jobs.

4.2.6.2 Factors for labour turnover at NBC

Nature of work

The nature of work is another critical factor which influenced labour turnover at NBC. The Study found that employees were working long hours including weekends due to the nature of work. Employees had little time for their family and other social affairs this fact made most employees to plan to leave the bank once given other opportunities
elsewhere especially outside the banking sector. In relation to the above feelings one respondent in the interview had the following comments:

Most of us are not enjoying life outside work and thus can’t balance work and life.

Likewise most employees especially in branch offices did not know the exact time for leaving their offices, another respondent during the interview commented that:

We come to work very early in the morning (say 7.00 am) to prepare ourselves for attending customers when it reaches 3.30 pm, all doors are closed with customers inside, then we have to continue serving those customers until they finish and from there we start doing reconciliation of the day transactions which normally takes us up to 9.00 pm.

**Career Progression**

Career progression at NBC was also identified as one of the reason for employees to leave the Bank. During the interviews it was revealed that most of the employees tended to work as acting personnel in the senior positions however, unfortunately, at the end those positions were filled by external people who did not work with the bank previously. This tendency seemed to act as a factor against career progression and motivated the employees as they saw that their performance was not rewarded accordingly as they expected. Therefore it can be said that such a tendency seemed to be a reason for them to leave and hence a factor for labour turnover at NBC. For example at the time of the interviews, it was provided that one employee acted in one of the senior position in a bank for more than one year but later that position was filled by a person from outside. This demotivated that very employee and had the feeling of leaving the bank.
Work Environment

Through the review of documents, for example records of exit interviews kept in the bank, apart from nature of work, luck of opportunities for career growth and poor work relationship with immediate managers, finding greener pasture elsewhere also motivated employees to leave the bank.

Although the recruitment and selection policy show that competency in relation to the job is the most important criteria for being employed at NBC for the bank to be regarded as a greener pasture depended on the perception of each individual employee as noted elsewhere in this section.

4.2.7 Trend of Labour Turnover

4.2.7.1 Turnover Trend: 2007-2012

The following data was collected on employee turnover trend at NBC bank under the study from the year 2007 to the 2012. The information was collected through interview that was made with the HR Manager and after reviewing exit interview documents.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Number of exit employees</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Field data, 2013
The findings above show that the number of exit employees of the NBC bank for the past six years has been on the rise from the year 2007 to 2012. The number rose from 9 employees in 2007 to 26 employees in 2012 per annum. In total, the bank lost a total of 102 employees from 2007 to 2012. These findings show an upward trend which show that the bank has been experiencing the problem of employee turnover.

4.2.7.2 Employee Turnover Rates
The researcher set out to establish the employee turnover rate among members at the bank. The employee turnover rate was calculated by using the formula below;

\[
\text{Total number of leavers over period} \times \frac{100}{\text{Average total number employed over period}}
\]
Table 4.4 Employee Turnover Rates

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Number of exit employees</th>
<th>Total number employed</th>
<th>Turnover rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>18%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>23%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>512</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Study Findings, 2013

From the findings above show that employee average turnover rate is 20%. This means in any given year, out of 100 employees, 20 leaves. This is a relatively high turnover rate and it may have high impact on the performance of the bank especially when turnover is happening on critical position or involves more talented employees. Also the trend show that the turnover rate has been increasing year after year which actually is a red flag and an indicator that the management of the bank hasn’t done enough to control employee turnover.

4.2.7.3 Age profile of exit employees

The researcher analyzed data on the age profile of exit employees for three consecutive years. The findings from the analysis were documented as shown in the table and figure below;
Table 4.5: Age profile of exit employees

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age Group</th>
<th>Number of exit employees</th>
<th>Percentage (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>18-30 years</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>57%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31-45 years</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Above 45 years</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>65</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Field data, 2013

The results show that 57% of exit employees were in the 18-30 age group compared to 29% of exit employees who were in the 31-45 age group and 14% of exit employees of who were in the above 45 age group. These findings suggest that the intention to exit diminishes with age. This indicates the young generation is more employable and thus causes more employee turnover in the Bank.

4.2.7.4 Level of education of exit employees

The researcher analysed data on the level of education of exit employees for three consecutive years. The findings from the analysis were documented as shown in the table below:

Table 4.6: Level of education of exit employees

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level of Education</th>
<th>Number of exit employees</th>
<th>Percentage (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Certificate/Diploma</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Degree</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post graduate/Masters</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>65%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>65</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Study Findings, 2013
The results show that 65% of exit employees had Post Graduate Diplomas or Masters Degree, followed by 25% of exit employees who had degrees and 11% of exit employees who had Certificates or Diplomas. The findings show that exit and or the intention to leave among employees increases as their level of education increases.

### 4.2.7.5 Gender profile of exit employees

The researcher analysed data on the gender profile of exist employees for three consecutive years, the findings from the analysis were documented as shown in the table and figure below;

**Table 4.7: Gender profile of exit employees**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Males</th>
<th>Females</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of exit employees</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage (%)</td>
<td>66%</td>
<td>34%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Field Data, 2013

From the data shown above, it is clear that 66% of exit employees were males while 34% of exit employees were females. These findings suggest that male employees are more likely to have the intention to exit compared female employees. The researcher observed that female employees of the bank are less likely to exit because they tend to be more satisfied with their jobs and are less likely to change jobs frequently due to various factors such as family obligations and influence from their husbands, for those who are married.

### 4.2.7.6 Level of work experience of exit employees

The researcher analysed data on the level of work experience of exist employees for three years and the findings from the analysis were documented as shown in the table below;
### Table 4.8: Level of work experience of exit employees

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Work Experience</th>
<th>Number of exit employees</th>
<th>Percentage (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0-5 years</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>51%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-10 years</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 years or more</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Field data, 2013

From the findings of the study, 51% of exit employees had work experience of 0-5 years, 29% of exit employees had work experience of 6 to 10 years and 20% of exit employees had work experience of 11 years or more. These findings show that the intention to turnover among employees diminishes as work experience increases. From the researcher’s observations, most of new joiners come in the bank with a lot of expectations hoping that those expectations will be met within a short period of time, the moment their expectations are not realized, they immediately plan to leave. At the same time it becomes more difficulty for them to leave the bank once they have stayed for more than five years since they have become familiar to the working environment and thus they are used to the culture and work style.

#### 4.2.7.7 Position held by exit employees at the time of exit

The researcher analysed data on the position held by exit employees at the time of exit for three consecutive years and the findings from the analysis were documented as shown in the table below;
Table 4.9: Position held by exit employees at the time of exit

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Number of exit employees</th>
<th>Percentage (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Managers</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>17%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supervisors</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>43%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Officer</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>32%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clerical</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Field Data, 2013

The study found out that 43% of exit employees are held at Supervisor Positions, while 32% of exit employees are held at Officer Positions, 17% held Manager Position and 8% of exit employees are held at Clerical positions. This shows that the intention to exit among employees increases at middle cadre, the cadre which is much ambitious for climbing the ladder to manager position and further career growth.

4.2.8 Reasons or causes of labour turnover

The researcher analysed various reasons for employee leaving NBC bank from respondents and the feedback was documented as shown below;

4.2.8.1 Senior staff enjoys more recognition than junior staff

The Feedback from respondents on whether senior staff enjoy more recognition than junior staff as a reason for staff turnover were analysed and the findings from the analysis were documented as shown in the table below;
Table 4.10: Senior staff enjoys more recognition than junior staff

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>No. of respondents</th>
<th>Percent (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>63%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>19%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly disagree</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>32</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Field Data, 2013

The findings above show that a total 82% of respondents agreed that Senior Staff enjoys more recognition than Junior Staff. As indicated in 4.1.7.7 above, 55% of exits were at Officer and Supervisory levels during their exit time, this show that they had ambitions of more career move to senior levels so that they can enjoy more recognition. Furthermore the documents (exit interview records) reviewed by the researcher show that most employees leave to places or organizations where they think their contributions can be more recognized.

4.2.8.2 Opinions of employees are undervalued

The feedback from respondents on whether their opinions are undervalued as a reason for turnover was analysis and documented as shown in the table below;

Table 4.11: Opinions of employees are undervalued

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>No. of respondents</th>
<th>Percent (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>84%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly disagree</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>32</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Field Data, 2013
The findings above show that 100% of respondents agreed that employee’s opinion are undervalued.

From the interviews held, the researcher found that there a no structured departmental meetings, the only structured meetings available is for senior management only. One of the interviewee said:

We, middle and lower cadre employees do not have a proper channel to air our views, most of the time is a one on one communication with managers and once you are done with that communication no action is taken. Again we have two trade unions here which is a full of contradiction between the two.

The researcher observed that there were two trade unions (FIBUCA and TUICO) both representing employees with a representation of 51% and 49% consecutively, however FIBUCA was the one being recognized by the employer (NBC). This meant 49% of employees who were TUICO members were not well represented to management and thus their opinion and concerns were not taken on board.

4.2.8.3 Additional qualifications of employees are not recognized

The researcher analysed the feedback of respondents on whether additional qualifications of employees are not recognize as among of the reasons for employee turnover. The findings from the analysis were documented as shown in the table below;
The findings above show that a total of 81% of respondents agreed that employee’s additional qualification is not recognized.

From the interviews the researcher held with some of the respondents, it was found that seniority and promotion were not determined by the education level and thus any additional qualification did not guarantee any career move. One interviewee during the interviews provided that:

We use our own money to further up our education qualification, once we complete no one bothers; you remain with your position, pay and all other terms of employment and worse enough you might have a master’s degree but working at the same level and position with a form six holder.

Further NBC Training and Development Policy (2009), provides as follows:

The Bank does not directly sponsor employees for further studies, and for those employees enrolled privately for further studies, they are not allowed to study full time.
4.2.8.4 Qualifications are considered for promotion

The researcher analysed the feedback of respondents on whether or not qualifications are considered for promotions as one of the reasons for intention to stay or leave. The findings from the analysis were documented as shown in the table and figure below;

Table 4.13: Qualifications are considered for promotion

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>No. of respondents</th>
<th>Percent (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>84%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly disagree</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Field Data, 2013

The findings above show that a total of 94% of respondents disagreed that Education qualification is considered for promotion.

The findings from the interview show that employees go for further studies with the ambition for career development. Once they are not promoted, the chances of leaving the bank become very high.

4.2.8.5 Work experience is considered for promotion

The researcher analysed the feedback of respondents on whether work experience is considered for promotion as among the reasons of employee turnover. The findings from the analysis were documented as shown below;
Table 4.14: Work experience is considered for promotion

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>No. of respondents</th>
<th>Percent (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>84%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly disagree</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>32</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Field Data, 2013

The findings above show that a total of 93% of respondents agreed that work experience is considered for promotion.

The findings from the interview show that, young and competent employees are not considered for promotion due to few years that they have spent to the bank. This makes a lot of young competent employees to leave the bank.

4.2.8.6 Dissatisfaction with job characteristics / content

The researcher analysed the feedback of respondents on whether dissatisfaction with job characteristics / content is one of the reason for employee turnover. The findings from the analysis were documented as shown below;

Table 4.15: Dissatisfaction with job characteristics / content

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>No. of respondents</th>
<th>Percent (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Very satisfied</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Satisfied</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>19%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dissatisfied</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>63%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Very dissatisfied</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>32</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Field Data, 2013
The findings above show that 10% of respondents are very satisfied with their job conditions, 10% of respondents satisfied, 30% of respondents were Neutral and 50% of respondents dissatisfied. There were no respondents who very dissatisfied.

4.2.8.7 Dissatisfaction with relationship with supervisors

The researcher analysed the feedback of respondents on whether or not they are satisfied with relationships with their supervisors. The findings from the analysis were documented as shown in the table and figure below;

Table 4.16: Satisfaction with relationship with supervisor

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>No. of respondents</th>
<th>Percent (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Very satisfied</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Satisfied</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dissatisfied</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>38%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Very dissatisfied</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Field Data, 2013

The findings above show that a total of 54% of respondents are dissatisfied with their relationship with supervisors.

From the interviews held, the findings show that most supervisors were subjective towards managing performance of their employees especially during the appraisal process that the performance appraisal process called for bad employee- manager relationship and thus created intention for employees to leave the bank. However the finding from the reviewed the performance management policy indicated that:

All performance objectives must be SMART, and their rating / reviews should result from a dialogue between an employee and
Manager and incase an employee is not satisfied he has to appeal through his respective Human Resource Business Partner (HRBP).

### 4.2.9 Coping with Labour Turnover at the Bank

From the interview held, the researcher found that the bank has come up with a number of strategies to overcome / reduce labour turnover at the Bank. Among these measures are:

i. Introduction of the graduate trainee programs, this is the program in which fresh graduates are recruited and put into a one year full course program in South Africa. The objective of this program is to ensure that employees are well instituted with NBC and ABSA culture well in advance. The philosophy behind this program is that once fresh graduates are cultured on the way the bank wants, it will be difficult for them to change employer and thus easy to retain them. Again the program is aimed at preparing successors for future turnovers.

ii. The bank thorough it training center at Kawe – Dar es Salaam, is providing training and development programs to its employees and Ongoing coaching, retreats and training to top performers.

iii. The bank through human resource department has introduced a dedicated section responsible for talent management.

iv. The Managing Director has introduced MD roadshow in which she goes around branches to hear employees concerns and work them out.

### 4.2.10 Concluding Remarks

In relation to labour turnover at NBC, there are number of things worth noting from the researcher’s findings as mentioned below:
i. That, there is a problem of labour turnover at NBC bank, and it is on the increasing trend year after year.

ii. Labour turnover at NBC has a lot to do with age, as the findings show that employees at the age range of 18 years to 30 years are highly mobile as compared to other age groups

iii. That, the turnover at NBC happens to employees mostly with first and second degrees

iv. That, employees at supervisory level are the ones most leaving the bank as compared to other grade levels

v. The NBC management has realized labour turnover to as a problem at the Bank and thus has come up with some measures in trying coping with labour turnover in the bank.

4.3 State of Labour Turnover at Stanbic Bank

4.3.1 History of Stanbic Bank

Stanbic Bank Tanzania Limited is a full service commercial bank which specializes in providing facilities and services to public and private sector corporations, diplomatic missions and international organisations. It is a member of the Standard Bank Group of South Africa and was established in May 1995 after the Standard Bank Group acquired the operations of Meridien Biao Bank Tanzania Limited.

Standard Bank Group is a global bank with African roots. It is South Africa’s largest bank, distinguished by its extensive operations in 18 African countries. Outside the African continent, the Standard Bank Group’s operations span 18 countries, with a focus on emerging markets. As part of Africa’s largest bank, Stanbic Bank Tanzania has ten branches across the country in major cities and towns.
4.3.2 Stanbic Vision and Mission Statements

Stanbic vision is to be the leading securities firm in the East African region and this statement is adopted from the Standard Bank Group Vision which states:

- We are committed to making a real difference to financial services in Africa and other emerging markets.
- We will ensure long-term sustainability by harmonizing the needs of our customers, our people and our shareholders and by being relevant to the societies in which we operate.
- We will only succeed if we are able to attract, retain, develop and deploy teams of people with energy, passion and skills.

Stanbic bank is driven by core corporate values in its operations across the country and worldwide, these values are serving our customers, growing our people, delivering to our shareholders, Being proactive, Working in teams, Guarding against arrogance, Respecting each other and Upholding the highest levels of integrity.

4.3.3 The Role of Human Resource Department at Stanbic Bank

The human resource department at Stanbic bank is structured in such a way that there are three reporting lines, that is: there is a direct reporting line in which the Head of departments reports to the Managing Director in Tanzania and also there are other two indirect reporting lines in which the Head of departments reports to the Regional HR Director in Nairobi and to the Group HR Director in Johannesburg.

The HR department is led by the Head of Human Resource assisted by two HR Consultants and one Training and Development consultant. The department major functions include Recruitment and selection, Training and Development, performance management and compensation and benefits management.
The department is also the custodian of all HR policies and procedures. However most of the policies are adopted from the mother bank (group level) in South Africa and then get customized to suit Tanzanian environment. Among of the HR policies in place includes Recruitment and selection, Induction, Performance Management, Rewards Management, Training and Development and Talent Management policies.

4.3.4 Age profile of respondents
The researcher analysed the age profile of respondents and feedback was documented as shown in the table below;

Table 4.16: Age profile of respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No. of respondents</th>
<th>25-30 years</th>
<th>31-35 years</th>
<th>36-40 years</th>
<th>41-50 years</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Field Data (2013)

Findings of the study show that 50% of respondents were aged 31-45 years, 22% of respondents were aged 36-40 years, 17% of respondents are aged 25-30 years and 11% of respondents were aged 41-50 years.

4.3.5 Gender profile of respondents
The researcher analysed gender of respondents and feedback was documented as shown in the table below;

Table 4.17: Gender profile of respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Males</th>
<th>Females</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No. of respondents</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td>39%</td>
<td>61%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Field Data (2013)
Findings above show that 61% of respondents were females and 39% of respondents were males. These findings show that there are more female respondents than male respondents.

4.3.6 Labour Turnover at Stanbic Bank

4.3.6.1 Understanding the Factors for Labour Turnover

Career progression
Through the interviews conducted with 17 respondents from Stanbic bank, it was noted that employees felt that lack of well-defined career progression at the bank was the leading cause of labour turnover. This tendency was contributed by the fact the banks growth had been stagnant for the past 8 years. That is the bank has remained with 10 operational branches since 2007 to date. This seemed to impact on the individual employees and limits their career growth as they continued to remain in the same position for a long period of time. As a result some who lacked patience decided to leave the bank. One of the interviewed respondents in the operations provided the following in that response:

I have been in the same position for the past seven years in operations department, for me to move a one step up, I am waiting for my boss either to resign or die.

Working Relationship
While career progression was noted as a major issue for employee turnover at Stanbic, the findings from the interviews show that poor relationship between managers and subordinates as well as unilateral favoritism of some of the senior managers seemed to be a challenge and source of employee turnover at the bank. Based on this revelation, those employees who perceived they to be talented had the opinion that any mistreatment they experienced meant that they should resign. To their views and perception which were revealed during the interviews, resignation as a response to mistreatment was the best option to most of them.
Nature of work
The nature of work was another critical factor which influenced labour turnover at Stanbic. Employees felt that they were understaffed and thus overworked. For employees in retail and operations departments revealed that one could perform duties that could be done by two or three employees as it was provided by one of the respondents during the interview as provided here:

We normally know our time in but we don’t know our time to be out, this has been that way since years back and we don’t sees it going to change in the near future” and thus we are here because we haven’t found elsewhere to go as our way out, but the moment I find an opportunity elsewhere but not in the banking sector, I will issue a 24 hours’ notice.

Management Style
Despite the fact that employees positively appraises the policies and procedures at the bank and indicated that they could be the means to minimize labour turnover, the challenge so far is on the implementation and monitoring of those policies and procedures. Most of the interviewed employees had the opinion that at the bank there were some managerial powers which overruled the process.

4.3.7 Trend of Labour Turnover
4.3.7.1 Turnover Trend at Stanbic Bank: 2007-2012
The following data was collected on employee turnover trend at Stanbic bank under the study from the year 2007 to the 2012. The information was collected through interview that was made with the HR Consultant and thereafter reviewing exit interview documents.
Table 4.18: Employee turnover trend 2007-2012

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Number of exit employees</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Field Data, 2013

Figure 4.18: Employee turnover trend 2007-2012

The findings above show that the number of exit employees of the Stanbicbank has been increasing for the first four years, reduced in the fifth year and then increased on the sixth year. In total, the bank has lost a total of 40 employees from 2007 to 2012 with an average of 7 employees per annum.
4.3.7.2 Employee Turnover Rates

The researcher set out to establish the employee turnover rate among members of staff of the bank. The employee turnover rate was calculated by using the formula below;

\[
\text{Turnover rate} = \frac{\text{Total number of leavers over period} \times 100}{\text{Average total number employed over period}}
\]

Table 4.19 Employee Turnover Rates

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Number of exit employees</th>
<th>Total number employed</th>
<th>Turnover rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>14.29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>14.71%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>22.22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>20.75%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>5.08%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>9.72%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>291</td>
<td>13.75%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>14.46%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Field Data, 2013

The findings above show that employee average turnover rate is 14.46%. This means in any given year, out of 100 employees, 14 leaves. This is a relatively high turnover rate and it may have high impact on the performance of the bank especially when turnover is happening on critical position or involves more talented employees. Also the trend show that the turnover rate has been fluctuating year after year but still on the higher side rate which actually is a red flag and an indicator that the management of the bank hasn’t done enough to control employee turnover.

4.3.7.3 Age profile of exit employees

The researcher analyzed data on the age profile of exit employees for three consecutive years. The findings from the analysis were documented as shown in the table and figure below;
Table 4.20: Age profile of exit employees

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age Group</th>
<th>Number of exit employees</th>
<th>Percentage (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>18-30 years</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>52%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31-45 years</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Above 45 years</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Field Data, 2013

The results show that 52% of exit employees were in the 18-30 age group compared to 33% of exit employees who were above 45 years and 14% of exit employees who were in the 31-45 age group. This indicates that young generation is more employable and thus causes more employee turnover in the Bank.

4.3.7.4 Level of education of exit employees

The researcher analysed data on the level of education of exit employees for three consecutive years. The findings from the analysis were documented as shown in the table below:

Table 4.21: Level of education of exit employees

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level of Education</th>
<th>Number of exit employees</th>
<th>Percentage (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Certificate/Diploma</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Degree</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>43%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post graduate/Masters</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>43%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Field Data, 2013

The results show that a total of 86% of exit employees had First degree, Post Graduate Diplomas or Masters Degree. The findings show that exit and or the intention to leave the bank become higher for employees with at least first degree.
4.3.7.5 Gender profile of exit employees

The researcher analysed data on the gender profile of exist employees for three consecutive years, the findings from the analysis were documented as shown in the table and figure below;

Table 4.22: Gender profile of exit employees

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Males</th>
<th>Females</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of exit employees</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage (%)</td>
<td>71%</td>
<td>29%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Field Data, 2013

From the data shown above, it is clear that 71% of exit employees were males while 29% of exit employees were females. These findings suggest that male employees are more likely to have the intention to exit compared female employees. The researcher observed that female employees of the bank are less likely to exit because they tend to be more satisfied with their jobs and are less likely to change jobs frequently due to various factors such as family obligations and influence from their husbands, for those who are married.

4.3.7.6 Level of work experience of exit employees

The researcher analysed data on the level of work experience of exist employees for three years and the findings from the analysis were documented as shown in the table below;
Table 4.2: Level of work experience of exit employees

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level of work experience</th>
<th>Number of exit employees</th>
<th>Percentage (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0-5 years</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>52%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-10 years</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 years or more</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Field Data, 2013

From the findings of the study, 52% of exit employees had work experience of 0-5 years, 33% of exit employees had work experience of 6 to 10 years and 14% of exit employees had work experience of 11 years or more. These findings show that the intention to turnover among employees diminishes as work experience increases. From the researcher’s observations, most of new joiners come in the bank with a lot of expectations hoping that those expectations will be met within a short period of time, the moment their expectations are not realized, they immediately plan to leave. At the same time it becomes more difficulty for them to leave the bank once they have stayed for more than five years since they have become familiar to the working environment and thus they are used to the culture and work style.

4.3.7.7 Position held by exit employees at the time of exit

The researcher analysed data on the position held by exit employees at the time of exit for three consecutive years and the findings from the analysis were documented as shown in the table below;
Table 4.2: Position held by exit employees at the time of exit

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Number of exit employees</th>
<th>Percentage (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Managers</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supervisors</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>71%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Officer</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>19%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clerical</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Field Data, 2013

The study found out that 71% of exit employees held Supervisor Positions at the time of exit, while 19% of exits were at Officer Positions, 10% were at Manager Position and none of the exit employees were at Clerical positions. This shows that the intention to exit among employees increases at middle cadre, the cadre which is much ambitious for climbing the ladder to manager position and further career growth.

4.3.8 Reasons or causes of labour turnover

The researcher analysed various reasons for employee leaving Stanbic bank from respondents and the feedback was documented as shown below;

4.3.8.1 Senior staff enjoys more recognition than junior staff

The Feedback from respondents on whether senior staff enjoy more recognition than junior staff as a reason for staff turnover were analysed and the findings from the analysis were documented as shown in the table below;
The findings above show that a total 94% of respondents agreed that Senior Staff enjoys more recognition than Junior Staff. Furthermore the documents (exit interview records) reviewed by the researcher show that most employees leave to places or organizations where they think their contributions can be more recognized.

4.3.8.2 Opinions of employees are undervalued

The feedback from respondents on whether their opinions are undervalued as a reason for turnover was analysis and documented as shown in the table below:

Table 4.25: Senior staff enjoys more recognition than junior staff

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>No. of respondents</th>
<th>Percent (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>94%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly disagree</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Field Data, 2013

Table 4.26: Opinions of employees are undervalued

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>No. of respondents</th>
<th>Percent (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>72%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>17%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly disagree</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Field Data, 2013
The findings above show that 100% of respondents agreed that employee’s opinion are undervalued.

From the interviews held, it was found that there was no trade union at Stanbic and thus employees have no representation in various forums within the organization. It was also observed that there were no structured departmental meetings except for senior management only. In this respect, one of the interviewee employee said that:

We, employees, don’t have proper forums, we have a lot of grievances but we don’t know how to take them up, the only best option available is to quit the job once there is an opening elsewhere.

### 4.3.8.3 Additional qualifications of employees are not recognized

The researcher analysed the feedback of respondents on whether additional qualifications of employees are not recognize as among of the reasons for employee turnover. The findings from the analysis were documented as shown in the table below;

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No. of respondents</th>
<th>Percent (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly disagree</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Field Data, 2013

The findings above show that a total of 83% of respondents agreed that employee’s additional qualification is not recognized.
From the interviews it was revealed that seniority and promotion are not determined by the education level and thus any additional qualification did not guarantee any career move. Likewise one interviewed respondent provided that:

we are not sponsored for further education and we are not allowed to study full time yet any additional qualification has nothing to do with our job, that how the policy says and we have to obey it.

However Stanbic bank training and development policy (2010),provides that:

The Bank does directly sponsor employees for further formal education, and for those employees enrolled privately for further studies, they are not allowed to study full time.

4.3.8.4 Qualifications are considered for promotion

The researcher analysed the feedback of respondents on whether or not qualifications are considered for promotions as one of the reasons for intention to stay or leave. The findings from the analysis were documented as shown in the table and figure below;

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Qualification</th>
<th>No. of respondents</th>
<th>Percent (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>72%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly disagree</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Field Data, 2013

The findings above show that a total of 100% of respondents disagreed that Education qualification is considered for promotion.

The findings from the interview show that employees go for further studies with the ambition for career development. Once they are not promoted, the chances of leaving the bank become the available and best option.
4.3.8.5 Work experience is considered for promotion

The researcher analysed the feedback of respondents on whether work experience is considered for promotion as among the reasons of employee turnover. The findings from the analysis were documented as shown below;

Table 4.29: Work experience is considered for promotion

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>No. of respondents</th>
<th>Percent (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>44%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly disagree</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Field Data, 2013

The findings above show that a total of 72% of respondents agreed that work experience is considered for promotion.

The findings from the interview show that, young and competent employees are not considered for promotion due to few years that they have worked with the bank. This makes a lot of young competent employees to leave the bank.

4.3.8.6 Dissatisfaction with job characteristics / content

The researcher analysed the feedback of respondents on whether dissatisfaction with job characteristics /content is one of the reason for employee turnover. The findings from the analysis were documented as shown below;
Table 4.30: Dissatisfaction with job characteristics / content

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Satisfaction Level</th>
<th>No. of respondents</th>
<th>Percent (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Very satisfied</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Satisfied</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>17%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dissatisfied</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Very dissatisfied</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>18</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Field Data, 2013

The findings above show that 50% of respondents are either satisfied or dissatisfied with their job content, this makes employees to be like at the cross road and at position of once approached by another employer, they quit their job.

4.3.8.7 Dissatisfaction with relationship with supervisors

The researcher analysed the feedback of respondents on whether or not they are satisfied with relationships with their supervisors. The findings from the analysis were documented as shown in the table and figure below;

Table 4.31: Satisfaction with relationship with supervisor

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Satisfaction Level</th>
<th>No. of respondents</th>
<th>Percent (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Very satisfied</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Satisfied</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dissatisfied</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>17%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Very dissatisfied</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>18</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Field Data, 2013
The findings above show that a total of 45% of respondents are dissatisfied with their relationship with supervisors.

From the interviews held, the findings show that the subjectivity on the whole process during the performance appraisal is the major cause of poor relationship between the supervisor and subordinate. Most employee feels that the whole process of performance management and subsequent bonus distribution is not fair, that managers do favour their best friends within the department regardless of their levels of performance.

4.3.9 Coping with Labour Turnover at Stanbic Bank

From the interview held, the researcher found that the bank has come up with a number of strategies to overcome / reduce labour turnover at the Bank. Among these measures are:

i. Introduction of the graduate trainee programs, this is the program in which fresh graduates are recruited and put into a one year full course program at the bank. These employees are exposed in various departments and functions of the bank before being given their permanent positions. These employees are expected to be given managerial positions in a span of 1 to 3 years. The main objective the program is to institute necessary skills and standard bank values to these fresh graduates as one aspect of their retention strategy and thus reduces turnover.

ii. The bank puts much emphasis on multirator aspect of performance appraisal. In this aspect employees are given a chance to rate the behavioural performance of their managers anonymously. This provides an opportunity for senior management team to know behaviours of the managers in the organization and plan for improvement with the aim of improving manager- employee relationship for retention purposes.
iii. The bank has put in place leadership programs for Supervisors and managers. These programs are coordinated by the Global Leadership Center in Johannesburg (owned by Standard Bank Group). The program is aimed at making Stanbic / standard bank managers better leaders and managers and thus be able to lead their employees better and reduce turnover.

4.3.10 Concluding Remarks

In relation to labour turnover at Stanbic bank, there are number of things worth noting from the researcher’s findings as mentioned below:

i. That, there is a problem of labour turnover at the bank and it is impacting the bank.

ii. That, male employees a more mobile as compared to female employees at the bank.

iii. That employees at the age range of 18 years to 30 years are more mobile as compared to other age groups

iv. That, the turnover at the bank happens to employees mostly with first and second degrees

v. That, employees at supervisory level are the ones most leaving the bank as compared to other grade levels

vi. The bank’s management has realized labour turnover to as a problem at the Bank and thus has come up with some measures in trying coping with the problem.
4.4 Cross Case Comparison

4.4.1 Reasons for Labour Turnover in the selected banks

Basing on the revelation from the cases, it seems that the reasons that made employees to leave the banks were not uniform to all employees who either left or had the intention to leave as shown on the table below:

Table 4.32: Reasons that could make you leave the current job

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason</th>
<th>Strongly agree</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Neutral</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Strongly disagree</th>
<th>Total Points</th>
<th>(%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Need for further studies</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>181</td>
<td>11.46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Need for career advancement</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>187</td>
<td>11.84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Need for recognition</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>162</td>
<td>10.26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Achievement</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>118</td>
<td>7.47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Need for job status</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>194</td>
<td>12.29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Utilization of competencies</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>192</td>
<td>12.16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Need for better pay</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>156</td>
<td>9.88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Need for better work conditions</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>124</td>
<td>7.85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Need for change of workplace</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>167</td>
<td>10.58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bad corporate image</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>6.21</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Field Data, 2013

Points scale: (N.B: Percentages are based on total points)
Strongly agree = 5, Agree = 4, Neutral = 3, Disagree = 2, strongly disagree = 1
Table 4.32: Reasons that could make you leave current job

From the findings shown above, the top five reasons that could make respondents leave their current job are; need for better pay (12.29%), need for career advancement (12.16%), need for change of workplace (11.84%), bad corporate image (11.46%) and need to utilize competencies (10.58%). Other reasons by diminishing level of significance include; going for further studies (10.26%), need for recognition (9.88%), more achievement (7.85%), need for a higher job status or promotion (7.47%) and need
for better work conditions. The findings show that employees are most likely to leave to pursue better opportunities, better pay and better work conditions elsewhere.

4.4.2 Willingness to stay on the job or readiness to leave

On the other hand, it seems that even the intention and willingness to stay and work in the bank received mixed perception and views from the respondents as collectively shown in the tables below:

Table 4.33: Willingness to stay on the job or readiness to leave

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Perception</th>
<th>No. of respondents</th>
<th>Percent (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I am willing to stay</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I am willing to stay, but I could leave</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not sure whether to stay or leave</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I am ready to leave but, I could stay</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I am ready to leave</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Field Data, 2013

Figure 4.33: Willingness to stay or readiness to leave

Source: Field Data, 2013
The findings above show that 50% of respondents are willing to stay, 30% of respondents are willing to stay but they could leave if a better opportunity arrives, 16% of respondents are not sure whether to stay or leave, while 4% of respondents are ready to leave if a better opportunity arrives but they could stay if things improve.

Table 4.34: Reasons that could make you stay at current job

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason</th>
<th>Strongly agree</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Neutral</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Strongly disagree</th>
<th>Total Points</th>
<th>(%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for further studies</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>149</td>
<td>8.14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Career advancement</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>199</td>
<td>10.87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recognition</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>177</td>
<td>9.67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>149</td>
<td>8.14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marital status</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>7.92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>163</td>
<td>8.91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Length of tenure</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>204</td>
<td>11.15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Practicing professionalism</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>122</td>
<td>6.67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for creativity</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>191</td>
<td>10.44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Salary raise</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>180</td>
<td>9.84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Better work conditions</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>151</td>
<td>8.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>1830</strong></td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Field Data, 2013

**Points scale:** (N.B: Percentages are based on total points)

Strongly agree = 5, Agree = 4, Neutral = 3, Disagree = 2, strongly disagree = 1

Figure 4.3.3 Reasons that could make you stay at current job
From the findings shown above, the top five reasons that could make respondents stay at their current positions are; length of tenure (the duration of time that respondents have been in the current job) (11.15%), opportunity for career advancement (10.87%), opportunity for creativity (10.44%), salary raise (9.84%) and recognition (9.67%). Other factors by decreasing order of significance are; gender (8.91%), better work conditions (8.25%), opportunity for further studies (8.14%), age (8.14%), marital status (7.92%) and practicing professionalism (6.67%). From the findings above it is clear that employees will voluntarily stay if given better compensation and better work conditions but will involuntarily stay due to their advanced age, gender or length of tenure.
4.4.3 Employee Turnover Costs

In general and specific terms, labour turnover does happen with embedded associated cost which directly impact the organizations, so were the two selected banks as case studies in this research. In this line of argument, both banks directly had to spent some amount of fund in respect to question labour turnover they experienced as indicated in the table below;

Table 4.35: Costs incurred by banks due to employee turnover

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of cost</th>
<th>Average cost incurred for each exit employee in TShs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Hiring Costs</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advertising cost</td>
<td>250,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recruiting costs</td>
<td>850,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Processing applications/CVs</td>
<td>300,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Background checks</td>
<td>70,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conducting interviews</td>
<td>80,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Administrative tasks</td>
<td>500,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Settle-in cost</td>
<td>800,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Training costs</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Orientation</td>
<td>1,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training</td>
<td>5,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL per exit employee</strong></td>
<td>8,850,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Field Data, 2013

The findings above show that on average, the banks loose TShs 8,850,000 for each exit employee. For 142 employees that the two banks lost from the year 2007 to 2012, the two banks lost a total of TShs 371,700,000 /-. This is an average of TShs 92,925,000 per year or TShs 7,743,750 per month. These findings suggest that employee turnover costs have a significant impact on the profitability of the two banks.
4.5 Discussion of the findings

On the basis of the ideas put forward by Lee and Mitchell (2000), it seems that labour turnover in the bank sector can be explained by relating Intrinsic, Extrinsic and individual characteristics as provided in the theoretical framework as follows:

4.5.1 Intrinsic characteristics

These are the motivation factors from within the individual that could influence an individual either to leave or stay. From the presentation and analysis of the finding, it is clear those intrinsic characteristics plays a major role towards employee turnover in the selected banks as outlined here under:

First, recognition: the findings have indicated that senior staff enjoys more recognition than junior Staff. This has been cited as among of the major reasons for more junior staff to leave the banks. Despite of the recognition program being well structure in the two banks yet employees feels that the whole process of implementing the program is not fair and the two banks must relook on it as a means of addressing labour turnover.

Second, need for achievement and advancement: need for achievement and advancement in terms of career and further education qualification is also much associated with labour turnover to the selected banks. The findings show that employees tend to leave the two banks just for either career growth on going for further studies. This entails that if employees are given opportunities (allowed to study fully time and or being sponsored by the employer) for further studies and if they are given fair opportunities for career growth, the labour turnover could have been minimized.

4.5.2 Extrinsic characteristics

These are the external reward (motivation factors) factors that might make an employee either leave or stay with the current employer. From the findings, it has been clearly indicated that Extrinsic factors contributes a lot to employee’s turnover of the selected banks.
First; Working condition and content of the Job: from both banks it has come out clearly that the working condition and content of the job is not favorable to most employees and thus being the major reason for them leaving. Employees feel that they are being overloaded by the job, doing more job than what is required for work life balance. They do miss time for social interactions and activities and also they miss time for their families. Based on the findings it is vital for the banks to review job descriptions of their employees and plan for flex working hours.

Second; policies: the findings show that the two banks have very good policies and programs for people retention; furthermore there are various good measures in place towards controlling labour turnover. The only challenge on the ground is the implementation of those policies and programs. For intense, despite both banks having graduate trainee programs in place in which the trainees are expected to be given managerial position in at least three years, the practice is not the same. Some of these trainees have stayed in supervisory levels for more than four years and thus calls for turnover.

Third; Supervision and relationship with managers: from both banks it has been revealed that employees leave because of poor relationship with their immediate supervisors or line managers. This aspect has been elaborated in relation to how these supervisors or a manager manages performance of their subordinates. It has been presented that the performance management process in both banks is subjective with a lot some elements of favoritism instead of adhering to the performance management principles of objectivity, transparency and fairness.

4.5.3 Individual Characteristics
These are those characteristics relating to demography of the individuals. They have nothing to do with the employer. The presented findings from both banks show that individual demography has a positive correlation with labour turnover that Employees
aged 18 – 30 years are more mobile than age groups, employers who have stayed between 0 - 5 years tend to quit jobs more easily than other age groups, males employees tend to leave jobs easily than female employees and also the higher the education qualification the more the employee become mobile. From these findings, it can be deduced that the management of the bank has to plan for retaining their employees in consideration to their demographic records instead of having one plan for all.
CHAPTER FIVE

SUMMARY OF FINDINGS, CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

5.1 Introduction
This chapter presents summary of findings, conclusion and recommendations.

5.2 Summary of Findings
The findings of the study showed that majority of the staff of the two banks are aged between 25 years to 40 years, with females making 60% of the population. Majority of them are educated up to degree and postgraduate level. Also, majority of them occupy an officer position. 75% of staff at the two banks have work experience of 10 years or less.

On the issue of recognition in the workplace, majority of respondents agreed that recognition is well structured within the two banks; however, it is most accorded to senior staff members. The respondents mentioned that the opinions of employees are undervalued. Also, the findings revealed that majority of respondents had the opinion that additional qualifications of employees are not recognized.

On the issue of promotion opportunities, the findings show that majority of respondents agreed that qualifications, work experience and performance are the main criteria considered during promotions. However, the findings show that respondents disagreed that gender equality is considered during promotions, and that is not the reason as to why there are very few females in management positions of the two banks.

On the issue of employee welfare, the study found that majority of respondents are very satisfied with the salary structure and employee benefits offered by the banks but they were not satisfied with the working environment, career advancement opportunities, availability of training opportunities or the characteristics of the job itself since the nature of the job is very hectic and time demanding. And this was established to be among the main reasons for high turnover.
With regard to the intention to leave or stay in the current position, 50% of respondents are willing to stay, 30% of respondents are willing to stay but they could leave if a better opportunity arrives, 16% of respondents are not sure whether to stay or leave, while 4% of respondents are ready to leave if a better opportunity arrives but they could stay if things improve. This suggests that provided better working environment, employees can stay longer with the banks.

The main reasons why employees stays are; length of tenure (the duration of time that respondents have been in the bank), opportunity for career advancement, opportunity for creativity, salary raise and recognition. In general, employees will voluntarily stay if given better work conditions but will involuntarily stay due to their advanced age, gender or length of tenure. This suggests that, Banks should have a structured retention plan, talent management and career development plan for their employees to stay longer and reduce their turnover rate.

The main reasons for leaving were identified to be need for better working environment, need for career advancement, need for change of workplace, bad corporate image and need to utilize competencies. Others are going for further studies, need for recognition and need for a higher job status or promotion. Thus, employees are most likely to leave to pursue better opportunities, better work conditions and better pay elsewhere.

These reasons for leaving are corresponding with reasons given by exit employees of the two banks where by 42% of exit employees mentioned looking for better working environment as the main reason for leaving, 28% of exit employees mentioned career advancement, 17% of exit employees mentioned better pay, and 13% of exit employees mentioned going for further studies.
From the study, the researcher found out that the intention to quit among employees diminishes with advancement of age. Also, the intention to quit increases as the level of education of employees increases and decreases as level of work experience increases. This is because as employees become more experienced and move up the corporate ladder from they become better paid and jobs and less likely to leave.

From the study, the researcher found out that the employee turnover rate at the two banks from the year 2007 to the year 2012 has stood at approximately 12%. This means in any given year, out of 100 employees of the banks, 12 leave for various reasons. This is a relatively high turnover rate and it may have high impact on the performance of the banks.

Majority of current employees of the bank said that the work conditions are not satisfactory and they are also not satisfied with the characteristics of their jobs. As a result of employee turnover, the researcher found out that the banks lose an average of TShs 371,700,000 /-. This is an average of TShs 92,925,000 per year or TShs 7,743,750 per month, or TShs 351,988.64 per day as costs incurred due to employee turnover.

5.3 Conclusions
From the findings of the study, the researcher found out that employee turnover has significant impact on performance of the two banks because it results in additional costs due to recruitment, hiring and training of new staff, it results in disruption of work flow due to vacant positions, it leads to lost productivity and lastly, but not least, it results in a huge loss of know-how, institutional memory and work experience of experienced employees who leave.

In conclusion, the assessment of the working environment is crucial and a regular system to capture and evaluate feedback must be in place in order to maintain a healthy work environment. This assessment can be done through employee’s satisfaction survey to be organized by the bank but conduct by an independent entity.
Turnover can have a detrimental effect on an organization and its employees if company management does not take proactive measures to retain its employees.

5.4 Recommendations
Prevention is better than cure. The banks should put their best effort to prevent and/or reduce employee turnover by retaining their employees. This will help the banks to save money, time, and effort wastage. The researcher recommends the following measures to be taken by the management of the two banks under this study.

- The management of the banks should put in place employees satisfaction surveys. This will help to detect areas in which employees are not satisfied which will eventually help management to plan and improve on those areas. The employees satisfaction surveys should not be a once off event but a continues event.
- It has been noted that most employees leaves the banks due to career advancement, this entails that, Banks should put in place a well-structured career progression plan for their employees to grow internally rather than advancing career-wise elsewhere.
- The management of the banks should re-lookon their recruitment process and plan to recruit fresh graduates with the aim of grooming them internally instead of poaching from other banks. Poaching (head hunting) recruitment style accelerates the rate of staff turnover in the banking sector.
- Banks employees finds their jobs to be hectic and time consuming, it is recommended that the banks should adopt working flex time for the sake of having work–life balance and at the same time improving working environment.
- Also, job description should include; job function, duties, responsibilities and qualifications. This will help to informs applicants of details of job parameters. Thus, the employees would know what to expect from the job and what the company expects from them.
- The banks should put more emphasis on employee retention as a corporate goal. More attention and effort by the management should be allocated to
increase employee retention by having in place and implementing a retention and
talent management programs.

- The banks should consider conducting salary and benefits benchmark surveys on
  an annual basis with the aim of positioning themselves well in the labour market
  in relation to their comparators.
- The banks should improve work conditions by making sure that employees have
  all the necessary tools they need to perform their duties effectively without stress
  or too much work.
- Work – life balance is critical to employee, the management of the bank should
  plan for flex work schedules to allow employees to have time for work, social
  and family activities
- The management of the bank should plan for structured departmental meetings to
  give opportunity for their employees to hear their views. At the same time the
  presence of trade union at work place is key for both banks
- Last, but not least, the banks should improve the management style specifically
  on the aspect of performance management and ensures that the principles of
  performance management of objectivity, transparency and fairness are adhered to
  so as to make employees feel comfortable to give their opinions on how to
  improve their performance and the performance of the bank as a whole. This
  shall be possible if the bank has open door policy to all its employees, if there is
  a grievance handling mechanism in place, if being honest, fair and objective are
  among of the values of the organization and employees are cultured to live those
  values.
REFERENCES


Burns, R. B. (200). Introduction to Research Methods, SAGE Publications Ltd


Hutchinson, S., Purcell, J. *Bringing Policies to life: the vital role of front line managers in people management*. Executive briefing. London: Chartered Institute of Personnel and Development. Available at http://www.cipd.co.uk/bookstore


Mohe Krausz; Nurit Yaakobovitz; Aharon Bizman; Tamir Caspi *Journal of Business and Psychology*; Fall 1999; 14, 1; ABI/INFORM Global

APPENDIX I

LABOUR TURNOVER IN THE BANKING SECTOR IN TANZANIA:

This questionnaire aims at collecting data on staff turnover in the Tanzania banking sector of its report shall be submitted to Mzumbe University- Dar es Salaam Campus College in the partial fulfilment of the requirement for the award of Master of Science in Human Resource Management Degree.

The information gathered in this survey shall be used for the purpose of this survey ONLY and all data shall be kept in strictly confidence; Your Bank will be provided with a copy of the report of this Survey.

Management’s and HR staff Questionnaire
(HR Manager should respond on behalf of Management of the whole Bank while other managers should respond in respect of their departments)

Personal Particulars
Name of the Bank; .................................................................
Your department.................................................................
Your Current Position; .........................................................
Length of service in your current position; ..........................
Length of service with your current Employer; .....................

Name of previous Employers (if any) and reasons for leaving
Employer 1; .................................................................
Reasons (Circle the correct reason/s)
(a) Salary (b) working environment (c) bad / conflict with manager/ supervisor (d) Limited chances for promotion
(e) Others (please explain)............................................
Employer 2;  .................................................................

Reasons (Circle the correct reason/s)
(a) salary  (b) working environment  (c) bad / conflict with manager/ supervisor  (d) Limited chances for promotion
(e) Others (please explain) ..............................................

Employer 3;  .................................................................

Reasons (Circle the correct reason/s)
(a) salary  (b) working environment  (c) bad / conflict with manager/ supervisor  (d) Limited chances for promotion
(e) Others (please explain) ..............................................

Questions relating to your current employer

1. Does the Bank experience problems in retaining employees?
   (a) Yes
   (b) No

2. Out of the below Strategies, Kindly indicate by order of priority 1 to 5, where 1 being the lowest and five being the highest; what strategies does the Bank employ or use to retain its employees?
   i. Proper Induction Programs  
      (   )
   ii. Enhances a culture of openness, Objectivity and Fairness 
      (   )
   iii. Provides Education support to employees and or their children  
      (   )
   iv. Provide gratuity as a retirement benefit 
      (   )
   v. Provides long service awards for recognition of long service 
      (   )
vi. Has a well-defined career development programs
   ( )

vii. Annual Salary and Benefits reviews reflects the labour market / Inflation
    ( )

viii. The Bank Uses flex working hours
     ( )

ix. The Bank always recruits or promotes from internal
    ( )

3. By ranking in order of priority (1 – 5; where 1 is the least reason and 5 being the
   most), Please indicate the turnover reasons given or registered by leaving employees
   i. Lack of Opportunities for Professional Development and Training ( )
   ii. Lack of Opportunities for career growth ( )
   iii. Inadequate Compensation ( )
   iv. Boredom/Lack of Challenge ( )
   v. Poor Work/Life Balance ( )
   vi. Job Stress and Unfair Treatment ( )
   vii. Poor leadership and management in the Bank ( )
   viii. Poor leadership and management of the immediate manager / supervisor ( )

4. Please can you provide the number on the following items?
   (i) Number of staff employed from 2009 to 2012.
       2009.............., 2010........, 2011........, 2012........

   (ii) Number of staff left the Bank by their qualifications and positions from January, 2009 to December, 2012
5. Do you have a retention policy in the Bank? ..........................
   If yes what does it entail
   ..........................................................................................................
   ..........................................................................................................
   ..........................................................................................................
   ..........................................................................................................
   and if no does the Bank intend to have the retention policy in near future?
   ..........................................................................................................
   ..........................................................................................................
   ..........................................................................................................
   ..........................................................................................................

6. Kindly tick what you find to be the most challenges or problems faced by Bank in retaining its employees.
   i. Monetary dissatisfaction (   )
   ii. Unavailability of internal career opportunities (   )
iii. Tendency of some employees of getting bored in a short span of time (  )
iv. Unrealistic expectations from the job (  )
v. Increased business competition (  )
vi. Cost of living (  )
vii. Scarcity of skills in the industry (  )

7. What kind of actions does the Bank apply if an employee is considering leaving their job? Kindly tick the most commonly strategies below :
   i. Call for counter offer (  )
   ii. Do an exit interview (  )
   iii. Withdraw access from sensitive IT systems (  )
   iv. Call employee for counselling (  )
   v. Employee asked to hand over his duties with immediate effect (  )
   vi. Employee asked to plan for replacement and a clear handover (  )
APPENDIX II

LABOUR TURNOVER IN THE BANKING SECTOR IN TANZANIA:

Employee’s (Managers, Supervisors, Officers & Clerical staff) Questionnaire

This questionnaire aims at collecting data on staff turnover in the Tanzania banking sector of its report shall be submitted to Mzumbe University- Dar es Salaam Campus College in the partial fulfilment of the requirement for the award of Master of Science in Human Resource Management Degree.

The information gathered in this survey shall be used for the purpose of this survey ONLY and all data shall be kept in strictly confidence; Your Bank will be provided with a copy of the report of this Survey.

SECTION A: BIOGRAPHICAL DATA

Please respond to the following biographical information to be used for statistical purposes only.

1. For how long have you been working with the Bank?
   (a) Less than or equal to 1 year
   (b) 2–5
   (c) 6–10
   (d) 11–15
   (e) 16 and above

2. What department are you working with?

3. What is your job Grade
   a) Management
   b) Supervisor
c) Officer
d) Clerical

4 What is your highest qualification?
   (a) Post school certificate or diploma
   (b) Bachelor’s degree or equivalent
   (c) Master’s degree
   (d) Doctoral degree

5 What is your gender?
   (a) Male
   (b) Female

6 What is your age?....................

SECTION B: RECOGNITION AT WORKPLACE
Please respond to the following questions regarding your recognition by the Bank. Use the scale provided below each statement to reflect your view

1. The Bank’s recognition scheme is well structured and covers all essential recognition elements
   (a) Strongly disagree   (b) Disagree   (c) Neutral (d) Agree (e) Strongly agree

2. Senior staff enjoys more recognition than junior staff
   (a) Strongly disagree   (b) Disagree   (c) Neutral (d) Agree (e) Strongly agree

3. Employees opinions are undervalued by the management staff
   (a) Strongly disagree   (b) Disagree   (c) Neutral (d) Agree (e) Strongly agree

4. Additional qualifications are not recognized
   (a) Strongly disagree   (b) Disagree   (c) Neutral (d) Agree (e) Strongly agree
**SECTION C: PROMOTION OPPORTUNITIES**
Please respond to the following questions on promotion opportunities in the Bank. Use the scale provided below each statement to reflect your view.

1. Qualifications are not considered for promotion
   (a) Strongly disagree   (b)   Disagree   (c) Neutral   (d) Agree   (e) Strongly agree

2. Experience is often the only consideration for promotion
   (a) Strongly disagree   (b)   Disagree   (c) Neutral   (d) Agree   (e) Strongly agree

3. My chances for being promoted are good
   (a) Strongly disagree   (b)   Disagree   (c) Neutral   (d) Agree   (e) Strongly agree

4. Performance is the only criteria considered for promotion
   (a) Strongly disagree   (b)   Disagree   (c) Neutral   (d) Agree   (e) Strongly agree

**SECTION D: INTENTION TO STAY**
Please respond to the following questions on your intention to stay with the Bank. Use the scale provided below each statement to reflect your view.

1. The Bank has a great deal of personal meaning for me
   (a) Strongly disagree   (b)   Disagree   (c) Neutral   (d) Agree   (e) Strongly agree

2. It would be very hard for me to leave the Bank now even if I wanted to
   (a) Strongly disagree   (b)   Disagree   (c) Neutral   (d) Agree   (e) Strongly agree

3. I feel that that I have few options to consider leaving the Bank
   (a) Strongly disagree   (b)   Disagree   (c) Neutral   (d) Agree   (e) Strongly agree

4. I do not feel emotionally attached to the Bank
   (a) Strongly disagree   (b)   Disagree   (c) Neutral   (d) Agree   (e) Strongly agree
5. I would feel guilty if I leave the Bank now
   (a) Strongly disagree   (b) Disagree   (c) Neutral (d) Agree (e) Strongly agree

6. One of the few negative consequences of leaving the Bank would be the scarcity of other job opportunities
   (a) Strongly disagree   (b) Disagree   (c) Neutral (d) Agree (e) Strongly agree

7. I would not leave the Bank now because I have a sense of obligation to its people
   (a) Strongly disagree   (b) Disagree   (c) Neutral (d) Agree (e) Strongly agree

8. Even if it were to my advantage, I do not feel it would be right to leave the Bank now
   (a) Strongly disagree   (b) Disagree   (c) Neutral (d) Agree (e) Strongly agree

9. I do not feel an obligation to remain with the Bank as my employer
   (a) Strongly disagree   (b) Disagree   (c) Neutral (d) Agree (e) Strongly agree

10. I would be very happy to spend the rest of my career with the outside the Bank
    (a) Strongly disagree   (b) Disagree   (c) Neutral (d) Agree (e) Strongly agree

11. If I get an opportunity elsewhere I will consider leaving the Bank
    (a) Strongly disagree   (b) Disagree   (c) Neutral (d) Agree (e) Strongly agree
SECTION E: COMPENSATION

Please respond to the following questions on your compensation by the Bank. Use the scale provided below each statement to reflect your view

1. The information about salary and benefits provided by the Bank
   (a) Very dissatisfied   (b) Dissatisfied   (c) Neutral   (d) Satisfied   (e) Very satisfied

2. The current total salary package
   (a) Very dissatisfied   (b) Dissatisfied   (c) Neutral   (d) Satisfied   (e) Very satisfied

3. The company’s pay structure
   (a) Very dissatisfied   (b) Dissatisfied   (c) Neutral   (d) Satisfied   (e) Very satisfied

4. The competitiveness of the basic salary package as compared with the labour market
   (a) Very dissatisfied   (b) Dissatisfied   (c) Neutral   (d) Satisfied   (e) Very satisfied

5. The competitiveness of other benefits as compared with the labour market
   (a) Very dissatisfied   (b) Dissatisfied   (c) Neutral   (d) Satisfied   (e) Very satisfied

6. How the Bank administers pay in various job grades
   (a) Very dissatisfied   (b) Dissatisfied   (c) Neutral   (d) Satisfied   (e) Very satisfied
SECTION F: TRAINING
Please respond to the following training questions. Use the scale provided below each statement to reflect your view

1. The Bank is providing me with job specific training
   (a) Strongly disagree   (b) Disagree   (c) Neutral   (d) Agree   (e) Strongly agree

2. I can apply the training skills I received in this Bank
   (a) Strongly disagree   (b) Disagree   (c) Neutral   (d) Agree   (e) Strongly agree

3. There are enough training and development opportunities in the Bank
   (a) Strongly disagree   (b) Disagree   (c) Neutral   (d) Agree   (e) Strongly agree

4. I have the opportunity to be involved in activities that promote professional development
   (a) Strongly disagree   (b) Disagree   (c) Neutral   (d) Agree   (e) Strongly agree

SECTION G: SUPERVISION
Please respond to the following questions on supervision. Use the scale provided below each statement to reflect your view

1. My manager/supervisor rewards good idea by implementing it and by giving the responsible employee(s) credit
   (a) Strongly disagree   (b) Disagree   (c) Neutral   (d) Agree   (e) Strongly agree

2. My manager/supervisor has a sense of recognition and appreciation
   (a) Strongly disagree   (b) Disagree   (c) Neutral   (d) Agree   (e) Strongly agree

3. My manager/supervisor is my best role model at work
   (a) Strongly disagree   (b) Disagree   (c) Neutral   (d) Agree   (e) Strongly agree
4. I feel undervalued by my manager/supervisor
   (a) Strongly disagree   (b) Disagree   (c) Neutral (d) Agree (e) Strongly agree

5. My manager/supervisor does often let me know how well I am performing
   (a) Strongly disagree   (b) Disagree   (c) Neutral (d) Agree (e) Strongly agree

SECTION H: COMMITMENT TO THE BANK
Please respond to the following questions on your commitment to the Bank. Use the scale provided below each statement to reflect your view

1. How would you rate your chances of working at the Bank a year from now?
   (a) Not likely at all   (b) Barely likely (c) Somehow likely
   (d) Quite likely       (e) Very likely

2. Do you intend to leave this Bank voluntarily in the near future?
   (a) Not likely at all   (b) Barely likely (c) Somehow likely
   (d) Quite likely       (e) Very likely

3. What are your plans for staying with the Bank?
   (a) I intend to leave as soon as possible   (b) I will leave if something better turns up (c) I will leave only if something better considerably turns up
   (d) I will leave only if something very much better considerably turns up (e) I intend to stay until I retire
SECTION I: CHARACTERISTICS OF THE JOB

Please respond to the following questions on your job characteristics. Use the scale provided below each statement to reflect your view

1. The job denies me any chance to use my personal initiative or judgement in carrying out the work
   (a) Strongly disagree (b) Disagree (c) Neutral (d) Agree (e) Strongly agree

2. The job is quite simple and repetitive
   (a) Strongly disagree (b) Disagree (c) Neutral (d) Agree (e) Strongly agree

3. The job gives me considerable opportunity for independence and freedom in how I do the work
   (a) Strongly disagree (b) Disagree (c) Neutral (d) Agree (e) Strongly agree

SECTION J: GENERAL QUESTIONS

1. Please indicate some reasons that can make you leave the Bank by ranking them in order of in their priority from 1 to 5; 1 being the least and 5 being the most
   i. Need for Further Studies ( )
   ii. Need for Career Advancement ( )
   iii. Need for Recognition ( )
   iv. Achievement ( )
   v. Need for Job Status ( )
   vi. Utilization of Competencies ( )
   vii. Corporate Image ( )
2. Please indicate some reasons that could make you stay in the Bank by ranking them in order of their priority from 1 to 5; 1 being the least and 5 being the most
   i. Opportunities for Further Studies ( )
   ii. Career Advancement ( )
   iii. Recognition of Excelling Performance ( )
   iv. My Age ( )
   v. My Marital Status ( )
   vi. My Gender ( )
   vii. My Length of Stay with my current Employer ( )
   viii. Practicing of Professionalism ( )
   ix. Availability of Opportunities for Creativity ( )

3. Assume you were the CEO, what would you do to increase the employees stay with the Bank? Rank them in order of their priority from 1 to 5; 1 being the least and 5 being the most
   i. Change the Management Style ( )
   ii. Pay Equitable Pay Packages ( )
   iii. Improve Job Security ( )
   iv. Standardized Salary Structures ( )
   v. Establish Clear Salary Determination Criteria ( )
   vi. Improve on Job Autonomy and Flexibility ( )
   vii. Improve Job Content ( )
   viii. Create a well-defined career growth ( )
   ix. Improve on bonus system and pay ( )
INTERVIEW GUIDE

This guide provides general questions to be used during the interview, however the researcher still come up with probing questions for more understanding and data collection.

NAME OF THE INTERVIEWEE...........................................................

POSITION OF THE INTERVIEWEE...................................................

ORGANIZATION ...........................................................................

DATE OF THE INTERVIEW..............................................................

1. For how long have you been with the Bank?

2. What can you tell about labour turnover in the Bank?

3. Do you see labour turnover as a challenge / problem to the Bank? Why?

4. In your opinion what do you see to be the causes of labour turnover in the bank?

5. In what grade or job levels do labour turnover happen most? Why these or this grade(s)?

6. In average, how many employees leave the bank in a month?

7. How costly is turnover to the Bank?

8. To what extent is talent management concept and policy useful to your organization?

9. What issues will make you leave the bank? And which ones will make you stay?

10. What efforts are in place to reduce labour turnover in the bank?

THANK YOU FOR YOUR COOPERATION